

HISTORIC DISTRICT BOAD OF REVIEW

Minutes

May 28, 2019

The Madison City Historic District Board of Review held a regular meeting on Tuesday, May 28, 2019 at 5:30 p.m. in City Hall. Valecia Crisafulli presided over the meeting with the following board members present: Owen McCall, John Collins, Susan Schmidt, and Betsy Lyman. Also present: Mark Johnson, Building Inspector and Nicole Schell, City Planner – Preservation Coordinator.

V. Crisafulli stated that May for many years has been the National Historic Preservation Month which was started by the National Trust. V. Crisafulli stated that she was invited by Historic Madison in 2010 to speak at their annual dinner. The topic of the speech was “Why Madison Matters”. V. Crisafulli continued that in 2010 the National Trust started the campaign of This Place Matters. During her time taking photos for that presentation, V. Crisafulli took a photo of a father helping his daughter with her homework. After moving to Madison in 2013, V. Crisafulli got to know the father and daughter. The point of the presentation in 2010 was that Madison matters because we are enriching our community’s future by valuing its past. The girl in the photo was Grace Brautigam. G. Brautigam attended the meeting and was asked to speak about growing up in the historic district.

G. Brautigam spoke about living in six different historic homes and her experience in fourth grade where they got to walk around downtown to learn about the different types of architecture. G. Brautigam expressed her appreciation for the downtown historic district and mentioned how neat it was that people from Louisville and Chicago come to Madison to see the historic buildings.

V. Crisafulli stated that during Preservation Month, the board stated a long standing tradition of honoring projects that were completed in the last year that the community might want to hear about the progress that had been made. This is a chance to show off our successful applications. N. Schell stated the first project was done by Cary and Julia Strouse who redid the property at 112 W First Street. N. Schell showed a before and after photo. C. Strouse presented on his project and showed some interior photos of the finished building. C. Strouse thanked N. Schell and M. Johnson for their help on this project. C. Strouse added that Tony and Lisa Hammock helped them choose the carriage house style. C. Strouse stated Roger Welch created a lot of the wood features of the building.

Mayor Welch presented the 2019 Madison Historic District Infill Award to Cary and Julia Strouse for the outstanding infill project at 112 W First Street.

N. Schell stated the second project was done by Joe and Susan Craig who renovated the property at 1055 W Main Street. N. Schell showed a before and after photo. J. Craig presented on his project and showed some before, during and after completion photos. J. Craig added that he had some history on the property and learned about the area of West Madison which is where this house is located. J. Craig guessed that the building was built between 1890 and 1910. J. Craig noted that after removing the aluminum siding, they were able to restore the historic wood siding. Additionally, they were able to restore the front windows and purchase historic doors that fit within the openings on the front and back sides.

Mayor Welch mentioned that this project was also a PACE grant and it is exciting to see this project completed. Mayor Welch presented the 2019 Madison Historic District Preservation Award to Joe and Susan Craig for the outstanding rehabilitation of 1055 W Main Street.

4/15/2019 Minutes:

V. Crisafulli asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting on April 15th and had any corrections or additions.

J. Collins moved to approve the minutes – seconded by O. McCall.

Roll Call:

S. Schmidt	Approved
B. Lyman	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
J. Collins	Approved
V. Crisafulli	Approved

Page 2

Historic District Board of Review

May 28, 2019

Minutes stand approved.

4/22/2019 Minutes:

V. Crisafulli asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting on April 22nd and had any corrections or additions.

B. Lyman moved to approve the minutes – seconded by S. Schmidt.

Roll Call:

S. Schmidt	Approved
B. Lyman	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
J. Collins	Approved
V. Crisafulli	Approved

Minutes stand approved.

V. Crisafulli gave an overview of what to expect for those who have never been to a Historic District Board of Review meeting. Once the application is announced the applicant or representative will come up to the microphone to answer any questions. Each applicant will be asked to sign the gold affidavit on the podium which states the required signage was up for the required amount of time. N. Schell will present the particulars on the project. The board will then go through a list of items to see if they meet the guidelines. V. Crisafulli added that at the end of each application the board will vote.

New Applications:

1. Lisa Shelton – C. of A. to replace French doors on second story porch with window.
Location: **605 Jefferson St.** Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

N. Schell showed existing photos of the structure and showed images of the proposed changes provided by the applicant. Lisa Shelton was present and noted that the doors only closed using a hook and eye.

O. McCall thanked the applicant for the photos included because they helped make the proposed project clear. O. McCall added that after looking at the photos, the doors actually opened onto a shingle roof which is not very safe. L. Shelton agreed. O. McCall stated the proposed change would not be very visible from the street.

J. Collins asked if the window would be a custom size. L. Shelton stated she hoped it wasn't but that it could be a custom size. L. Shelton stated she planned to fill the entire opening and stated her contractor told her that the window would fill the opening. V. Crisafulli asked if the window would be double hung. L. Shelton answered yes.

B. Lyman asked about the fill material .L. Shelton stated she didn't think there would be any. B. Lyman stated that the window would need a sill. L. Shelton stated there was already something at the base of the door which is raised and that could be incorporated into the sill. L. Shelton stated that if there isn't something there that will work as the sill now, she will have it look similar to the window sill next to it.

J. Collins stated the guidelines don't currently address changing out a door to a window. V. Crisafulli asked N. Schell for guidelines for this project. N. Schell stated she had it under doors and entrances but agreed with J. Collins that the guidelines don't really address this application's request.

B. Lyman noted that the proposed window height was 72 7/8 inches which should fill the opening.

V. Crisafulli asked for comment from the audience.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Historic District Board of Review

May 28, 2019

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
Roofs	53, 54	47	S. Schmidt – It does agree with the guidelines on pages 53-54. B. Lyman – I am looking at the part of the guidelines which say that if repair is no longer practical, replacement with an appropriate substitute material is appropriate. Shingles have been an appropriate substitute material. I believe it does meet the guidelines. O. McCall – I agree for the same reasons. J. Collins – I agree for the same reasons. V. Crisafulli – I agree for the same reasons.

V. Crisafulli asked for a motion. B. Lyman made the following motion:

“I move to approve the application at 806 W Second St. to replace the metal roof with shingles as the project has been proposed does meet the guidelines on pages 53-54. A COA should be approved”.

Motion was seconded by O. McCall.

Roll Call:

- S. Schmidt Approved
- B. Lyman Approved
- J. Collins Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- V. Crisafulli Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness passed. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

V. Crisafulli stated the COA was approved and the applicant could go ahead with the project pending the requisite permits were filed.

- 6. Heritage Trail Conservancy – C. of A. to install new 3 garage doors, metal roof, and LP Smart Siding.
 Location: **109 ½ Cragmont St.** Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

N. Schell showed existing photos of the structure and showed images of the proposed changes provided by the applicant. Bob Greene was present and represented the applicant.

B. Greene stated this building is rather unimpressive and they were looking to make some improvements. B. Greene added that the building is located near Tower Manufacturing and they wanted to install the same metal roof.

B. Lyman expressed her appreciation for the organization and their efforts within the community. B. Lyman asked if the LP Smart siding would be smooth. B. Greene stated he would be taking the recommendation from the board. B. Lyman recommended the smooth because it is more historically appropriate.

V. Crisafulli asked for comment from the audience.

Historic District Board of Review

May 28, 2019

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Residential Guideline Page #	Commercial Guideline Page #	Discussion
Garages & Outbuildings	45	---	B. Lyman – I don't think we have specific guidelines about replacing garage doors. What we tend to do is if it is a metal door and they are replacing it with a metal door, that tends to be approved. The roof will go from asphalt shingles to metal. The argument is about it matching the Tack Factory and it being an outbuilding. In my mind, that meets the guidelines. For the siding, the improvement of going from vinyl to LP Smart siding is will be a good improvement for this building and one that we look for when people are trying to improve their properties. For those reasons it does meet the guidelines on pages 45, 53-54, and 6-58. O. McCall – I agree for the same reasons. J. Collins – I agree for the same reasons. It is a non-contributing building. S. Schmidt – I agree for the same reasons. V. Crisafulli – I agree for the same reasons.
Roofs	53, 54	47	
Siding	56 - 58	---	

V. Crisafulli asked for a motion. O. McCall made the following motion:

“I move to approve the COA for 109 ½ Cragmont St. for the work on the garage: three new metal carriage house style doors, exposed metal fastener roof, and the smooth LP Smart siding”.

Motion was seconded by B. Lyman.

Roll Call:

- S. Schmidt Approved
- B. Lyman Approved
- J. Collins Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- V. Crisafulli Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness passed. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

V. Crisafulli stated the COA was approved and the applicant could go ahead with the project pending the requisite permits were filed.

Business – Staff Report:

Historic District Board of Review: Fast Track Applications

Applicant	Address	Date of Approval	Material
Gardner Insurance	606 E Main St	5/3/2019	Letter Sign on Building Aluminum Clad Sun Window Storm Windows
Karan Wilson	201 Walnut St	5/8/2019	Aluminum Provia Storm Windows
Glenna Wade	416 W Main St	5/9/2019	Wood Fence: 4 ft
Maryanne Imes	119 Wall St	5/14/2019	Aluminum Larson Storm Door
Chevel Bernius	624 W Third St 124 Wall St /	5/21/2019	
Jerry Estes	825 W Third St	5/22/2019	Wood Fence: 6 ft

Historic District Board of Review

May 28, 2019

Historic District Board of Review: 2018 COA Review

Applicant	Address	What Was Approved	Done According to COA?
THE MADISON VAUGHN LAND TRUST #7	906 E First St.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Remove and replace cloth awning with metal awning. Remove and replace plastic wraps with sliding dark or bronze colored glass doors. 	Yes
Schmidt, Tonya	116 W Main St.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Build 16-ft X 13-ft deck with staircase on rear of building. Add aluminum clad french door and aluminum clad window to rear of structure. Add two (2) porch lights to rear of structure. 	Yes
Helton, Jeannette Wallace	708 W Main St	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Add awning overhang to front of house. Add porch light. 	Yes
Grant, James	410 Mill St.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Enclose back porch and move existing window from brick wall to enclosed porch wall. Add metal awnings over windows and front door. Replace front railing. Extend front porch. 	Yes
Gold, Thomas	513 Mulberry St.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Build a 24-ft x 32-ft garage with a 10-ft x 17 -ft porch. Install a wood deck and ramp at rear of house. 	In Progress
Wade, Jerry	301 West St	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Replace existing wood garage door with a steel garage door 	Yes
Ortho Louisville LLC	766 W Third St	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Build a 6-ft x 15-ft 6-inch shed style porch. Install cement board siding on rear addition. Install period appropriate light on the front of the house. Install wood door to fit the original opening and install original window in existing opening. 	Yes
Lobb, Angela and Phillip	213 Jefferson St.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Maintain the 7 replacement windows recently installed and restore the rest of the windows 	Yes
Pittman, Mike and Linda	420 Elm St.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Replace existing service door and storm with new fiberglass door, aluminum clad side lites, and metal storm door 	Yes
Garwood, David	1061 W. Main St.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Build a 20-ft X 36-ft carport 	Yes

Historic District Board of Review

May 28, 2019

Business - New:

N. Schell stated that the accessory structure at 1104 W Second St. was deemed unsafe by M. Johnson and either has or will be demolished. O. McCall asked if it was contributing. N. Schell stated she did not look. S. Schmidt asked if the property owner would be in charge of removing it. N. Schell answered yes.

Business - Old: Revisions to the Design Guidelines

V. Crisafulli reminded the board about their special meeting on May 29th at 5:30pm to discuss the guidelines. V. Crisafulli asked for public comments on the guidelines since the special meeting will not have time for public comments.

K. McWilliams stated that he thought changes to non-contributing structures should be reviewed by staff with a sign off by the chair. This would save the board and applicants time.

Mike Pittman stated he would like the board to consider that the process be data driven and community driven. This can be done by resurveying the district and noting changes since the last survey (data driven) and surveying past applicants and residents (community driven). M. Pittman discussed forming an appeal board and mentioned how other communities use their zoning board as the appeal board for the zoning decisions. M. Pittman stated he would like to see the classifications used to be expanded. N. Schell stated that other communities are set up the same as our zoning board. The zoning board only reviews appeals of administrative decisions. The decisions of the zoning board are appealed through circuit court. The zoning board does review variances. M. Pittman stated he would like to see a process to have variances on the approved materials list.

Link Ludington stated he would like to see a guideline section regarding solar retrofitting for historic structures. L. Ludington stated the National Trust has resources regarding solar retrofitting for historic structures.

Business - Old: Committee Reports

V. Crisafulli stated the committees have both met once and do not have another meeting set. N. Schell stated she would get with D. Sharpe and get another meeting date set. L. Ludington stated the board could not make changes to the ordinance and that only city council can approve changes to an ordinance. The historic board is established by the enabling legislation. V. Crisafulli stated the board would make ordinance changes in the form of recommendations to city council.

No further business to be brought before the board.

B. Lyman made the motion to adjourn - seconded by O. McCall.

Meeting adjourned at 6:55p.m.

BY ORDER OF THE MADISON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

Valecia Crisafulli, Chair

Nicole M Schell, City Planner – Preservation Coordinator