

**HISTORIC DISTRICT BOAD OF REVIEW**

Minutes

June 26, 2023

**The Madison City Historic District Board of Review held the rescheduled meeting originally scheduled for Monday, July 24, 2023 on Wednesday, August 2, 2023 at 5:30 p.m. at 101 W. Main Street. Josh Wilber presided over the meeting with the following members present: Ken McWilliams, Owen McCall, Carol Ann Rogers, Mike Pittman, and Michael Zink. Also present was Brooke Peach – Historic Preservationist.**

J. Wilber gave an overview of what to expect for those who have never been to a Historic District Board of Review meeting. Once the application is announced the applicant or representative will come up to the microphone to answer any questions. B. Peach will present the particulars on the project. The board will then go through a list of items to see if they meet the guidelines. J. Wilber added that at the end of each application the board will vote.

**6/26/2023 Minutes:**

M. Pittman asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting for June 26, 2023 and had any corrections or additions.

K. McWilliams moved to approve the minutes. Seconded by M. Zink.

**Roll Call:**

M. Pittman	Approved
M. Zink	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
J. Wilber	Approved
C. Rogers	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved

**Minutes stand approved.**

**Applications:**

1. Carrie Kemper – C. of A. to replace three wood windows on the second-floor south alley side with vinyl windows.

Location: **712 E. Second St.**

Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Carrie Kemper was present at second calling of the application.

C. Kemper stated she replaced the windows due to rot, heat loss, and moisture infiltration. She also noted the wood surround remained and that only the window itself was vinyl. C. Kemper stated the wood windows were kept and stored in the home's basement.

O. McCall asked if there were pictures or any evidence of the window deterioration. C. Kemper emailed pictures from her PACE grant to B. Peach. B. Peach showed the pictures on the screens for the public and the HDBR. J. Wilber asked C. Kemper when she obtained her PACE grant and C. Kemper stated November 2022. J. Wilber asked why C. Kemper did not obtain HDBR approval for the windows at that time before installation and C. Kemper stated she only decided to add them when she received a lower bid than expected on another related part of the PACE project. C. Kemper stated she had planned to do windows anyway, so she amended the PACE agreement to include the three vinyl windows. She further stated she thought since the PACE committee approved the amendment, she was approved for the project. C. Kemper recounted the other aspects of the PACE project.

**Page 2**  
**Historic District Board of Review**  
**August 2, 2023**

J. Wilber asked who the contractor was and C. Kemper stated Mr. Herford was the contractor. J. Wilber stated the contractor should have known HDBR approval was required. C. Rogers asked why C. Kemper saved the windows if they were so deteriorated and C. Kemper stated she recognized they were part of the structure, so she saved them. O. McCall stated the windows did not appear to be 80% deteriorated but C. Kemper stated they were pretty deteriorated and causing heat loss. O. McCall noted the windows perhaps needed reglazing. C. Kemper asked how the percentage of deterioration was determined. B. Peach stated she usually will physically inspect windows prior to replacement to determine deterioration.

J. Wilber asked when the windows were replaced and C. Kemper stated December 2022. C. Rogers noted products like Abatron may be used to repair historic wood windows and asked why the windows were not replaced in-kind. C. Kemper stated as a contractor herself, she preferred the vinyl windows for their insulation. She also noted nearby properties that had vinyl windows on the front of the homes. C. Rogers stated other property owners who replace windows without approval and contractors who know better does not make it okay. C. Rogers also noted the original windows were 6/6 and if anything the new windows should have been 6/6. M. Zink asked even using vinyl why C. Kemper did not install 6/6. C. Kemper stated she went with what the contractor who measured recommended. O. McCall noted restoration of the original windows with even single or double pane and storm windows would be very energy efficient. C. Kemper stated she wanted operational windows and O. McCall noted there were storm windows that were fully functional to open and close. He also noted there were many of those around town.

J. Wilber asked for public comment and noted none.

**Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet**

<b>Building Element</b>	<b>Guideline Page #</b>	<b>Discussion</b>
15.0 Roofs	71-73	<p><i>O. McCall</i> – The goal is to preserve historic windows including all significant related items and elements such as frames, sashes, shutters, hardware, old glass, sills, trim, and moldings. That was clearly not done in this case. It is recommended to maintain historic windows and follow guidelines for maintenance. Historic windows should be repaired rather than replaced and if replaced, replaced in-kind with windows that match the historic windows as closely as possible. So, that would mean replacing a 6/6 with a 6/6. That was not done here. Alternative materials do not accurately resemble historic windows and may not be appropriate. Replacement windows should have three-dimensional muntins but the internal muntins are not approved. I would say according to the guidelines, with what has been done, the project is absolutely not in line with the guidelines.</p> <p><i>M. Zink</i> – I agree.  <i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree.  <i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree.  <i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree.</p>

J. Wilber asked for a motion. O. McCall made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review deny a COA to Carrie Kemper for the already installed windows located at 712 E. Main St.”

Seconded by K. McWilliams.

**Roll Call:**

J. Wilber                      Approved

K. McWilliams              Approved



**Page 4**  
**Historic District Board of Review**  
**August 2, 2023**

		<p>foundation should be similar or compatible and again, this is not going to be similar but it is compatible. The project is in conformance.</p> <p><i>O. McCall</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>M. Zink</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree.</p>
--	--	--

J. Wilber asked for a motion.

K. Mefford did ask the HDBR if they would consider including an option for either an egress window or a French door on the rear wall of the addition. J. Wilber stated the HDBR would have to approve one or the other, so if the applicants wished to change, they'd have to come back to the HDBR for approval on that change.

K. McWilliams made the following motion, "Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Keith Mefford and the Lindsay's at 719 W. Second St. to add a 15'x16' master bedroom addition on the rear. The materials are as follows: foundation will be stone, brick exterior, reusing the original back door as well as an original window, a standing seam roof, and an aluminum clad wood window."

Seconded by M. Pittman.

**Roll Call:**

M. Zink	Approved
M. Pittman	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
C. Rogers	Approved
J. Wilber	Approved

***The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.***

**Old/New Business:**

J. Wilber discussed the updated approval guidelines and asked B. Peach what measures were in place to ensure the staff member, regardless of who that might be, would follow all appropriate guidelines and ordinances. B. Peach stated the way the approval guidelines for staff review were written, any application that receives approval must follow both or be referred to the HDBR for full Board review.

K. McWilliams made a motion to approve the updated approval guidelines.

Seconded by M. Pittman.

J. Wilber	Approved
M. Pittman	Approved
M. Zink	Approved
O. McCall	Approved

Page 5  
 Historic District Board of Review  
 August 2, 2023

K. McWilliams      Approved

C. Rogers            Approved

**Staff Report:**

July 2023 Fast-Track Applications

Applicant	Address	COA
<b>Darrell Summers</b>	811 E. First St.	replace existing aluminum siding with LP smart siding; replace rear west side non-historic door with new wood 1/2 lite door; replace rear existing non-historic French doors with new wood French doors; replace existing non-historic windows with 6/6 aluminum clad wood windows
<b>Theresa Hitchcock</b>	323 E. Main St.	install 4'x4' wood sign at right angle on building
<b>Jeff Matheney</b>	708 E. Second St.	Install full-view storm doors on front & front side door; install fabric awning above front door & transom
<b>Rachel Fox</b>	129 E. Main St.	Install vinyl signage on front windows; install polymetal sign at right angle on front of building

July 2022 COA Review

Applicant	Address	COA	Completion Status
<b>Lyle &amp; Michele Pennington</b>	227 W. Main St.	Install sign on window & on front of building at right angle	Yes
<b>Catherine Burress</b>	410 W. Second St.	Install privacy fence in rear yard	Yes

Page 6  
 Historic District Board of Review  
 August 2, 2023

<b>Sandy Bailey</b>	736 W. Third St.	Replace vinyl shutters with wood shutters	No
<b>Scott Axline</b>	214 E. Third St.	Install a vinyl window on third floor	Yes
<b>Elyse Detmer</b>	104 E. Third St.	Replace a standing seam metal roof with asphalt shingle roof	Yes
<b>Raymond &amp; Donna Godward</b>	513 W. Main St.	Replace the windows, doors, & steps on the rear porch addition	Yes
<b>Riverfront Development</b>	120+ E. Vaughn Dr.	Build new viewing platform	In progress
<b>Kevin Watkins</b>	222 W. Second St.	Replace wood windows on front with aluminum clad windows	Yes
<b>Pamela Brown</b>	620 West St.	Build a new front porch & rear two-story addition	No
<b>Carl Adkins</b>	1016 W. First St.	Demolish a non-historic accessory building	Yes
<b>Todd Calvert</b>	1016 W. Main St.	Build a new rear addition & porch	In progress

M. Zink made a motion to adjourn the meeting – seconded by C. Rogers.

Meeting adjourned at 6:27 p.m.

**BY ORDER OF THE MADISON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW**

---

Josh Wilber, Chairman

---

Brooke Peach  
 Historic Preservationist