HISTORIC DISTRICT BOAD OF REVIEW

Minutes June 26, 2023

The Madison City Historic District Board of Review held the rescheduled meeting originally scheduled for Monday, July 24, 2023 on Wednesday, August 2, 2023 at 5:30 p.m. at 101 W. Main Street. Josh Wilber presided over the meeting with the following members present: Ken McWilliams, Owen McCall, Carol Ann Rogers, Mike Pittman, and Michael Zink. Also present was Brooke Peach – Historic Preservationist.

J. Wilber gave an overview of what to expect for those who have never been to a Historic District Board of Review meeting. Once the application is announced the applicant or representative will come up to the microphone to answer any questions. B. Peach will present the particulars on the project. The board will then go through a list of items to see if they meet the guidelines. J. Wilber added that at the end of each application the board will vote.

6/26/2023 Minutes:

M. Pittman asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting for June 26, 2023 and had any corrections or additions.

K. McWilliams moved to approve the minutes. Seconded by M. Zink.

Roll Call:

M. Pittman Approved

M. Zink Approved

O. McCall Approved

J. Wilber Approved

C. Rogers Approved

K. McWilliams Approved

Minutes stand approved.

Applications:

1. Carrie Kemper – C. of A. to replace three wood windows on the second-floor south alley side with vinyl windows.

Location: 712 E. Second St. Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

- B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Carrie Kemper was present at second calling of the application.
- C. Kemper stated she replaced the windows due to rot, heat loss, and moisture infiltration. She also noted the wood surround remained and that only the window itself was vinyl. C. Kemper stated the wood windows were kept and stored in the home's basement.
- O. McCall asked if there were pictures or any evidence of the window deterioration. C. Kemper emailed pictures from her PACE grant to B. Peach. B. Peach showed the pictures on the screens for the public and the HDBR. J. Wilber asked C. Kemper when she obtained her PACE grant and C. Kemper stated November 2022. J. Wilber asked why C. Kemper did not obtain HDBR approval for the windows at that time before installation and C. Kemper stated she only decided to add them when she received a lower bid than expected on another related part of the PACE project. C. Kemper stated she had planned to do windows anyway, so she amended the PACE agreement to include the three vinyl windows. She further stated she thought since the PACE committee approved the amendment, she was approved for the project. C. Kemper recounted the other aspects of the PACE project.

Page 2 Historic District Board of Review August 2, 2023

- J. Wilber asked who the contractor was and C. Kemper stated Mr. Herford was the contractor. J. Wilber stated the contractor should have known HDBR approval was required. C. Rogers asked why C. Kemper saved the windows if they were so deteriorated and C. Kemper stated she recognized they were part of the structure, so she saved them. O. McCall stated the windows did not appear to be 80% deteriorated but C. Kemper stated they were pretty deteriorated and causing heat loss. O. McCall noted the windows perhaps needed reglazing. C. Kemper asked how the percentage of deterioration was determined. B. Peach stated she usually will physically inspect windows prior to replacement to determine deterioration.
- J. Wilber asked when the windows were replaced and C. Kemper stated December 2022. C. Rogers noted products like Abatron may be used to repair historic wood windows and asked why the windows were not replaced in-kind. C. Kemper stated as a contractor herself, she preferred the vinyl windows for their insulation. She also noted nearby properties that had vinyl windows on the front of the homes. C. Rogers stated other property owners who replace windows without approval and contractors who know better does not make it okay. C. Rogers also noted the original windows were 6/6 and if anything the new windows should have been 6/6. M. Zink asked even using vinyl why C. Kemper did not install 6/6. C. Kemper stated she went with what the contractor who measured recommended. O. Mcall noted restoration of the original windows with even single or double pane and storm windows would be very energy efficient. C. Kemper stated she wanted operational windows and O. McCall noted there were storm windows that were fully functional to open and close. He also noted there were many of those around town.
- J. Wilber asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
15.0 Roofs	71-73	O. McCall – The goal is to preserve historic windows including all significant related items and elements such as frames, sashes, shutters, hardware, old glass, sills, trim, and moldings. That was clearly not done in this case. It is recommended to maintain historic windows and follow guidelines for maintenance. Historic windows should be repaired rather than replaced and if replaced, replaced in-kind with windows that match the historic windows as closely as possible. So, that would mean replacing a 6/6 with a 6/6. That was not done here. Alternative materials do not accurately resemble historic windows and may not be appropriate. Replacement windows should have three-dimensional muntins but the internal muntins are not approved. I would say according to the guidelines, with what has been done, the project is absolutely not in line with the guidelines. M. Zink – I agree. M. Pittman – I agree. K. McWilliams – I agree. C. Rogers – I agree.

J. Wilber asked for a motion. O. McCall made the following motion, "Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review deny a COA to Carrie Kemper for the already installed windows located at 712 E. Main St."

Seconded by K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

J. Wilber Approved

K. McWilliams Approved

Page 3 Historic District Board of Review August 2, 2023

M. Pittman Approved

O. McCall Approved

C. Rogers Deny

J. Wilber Approved

The motion to <u>deny</u> the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will <u>not</u> be issued for the entire project.

2. Keith Mefford – C. of A. to add a 15'x16' master bedroom addition on the rear; foundation will be block with a stone façade so as to match the existing; also will be using reclaimed late 1800-1900 brick for the exterior; reuse the existing original back door as well as the original window.

Location: 719 W. Second St. Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

- B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. B. Peach also noted the applicants would like to add a new wood or aluminum clad window for egress. Keith Mefford was present.
- K. Mefford noted the awning photo was an inspiration photo and the proposed awning would be similar but have a slightly different styling. He also noted the egress windows shown in the drawings on the front will be put on the back side corner and the smaller window in the back will go up front.
- J. Wilber asked K. Mefford what his relationship was to the applicant and K. Mefford stated he's simply a neighbor that is trying to help. O. McCall asked about the material for the new window and K. Mefford stated it would be aluminum clad wood. J. Wilber asked about the roofing material and K. Mefford stated it would be a standing seam roof. K. Mefford noted the property owners desired to have a historic look to their addition which is why they've chosen to use historic reclaimed brick, stone foundation materials, a standing seam roof, and will use reclaimed historic windows with one exception.
- J. Wilber asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
26.0 New Construction	106	M. Pittman – New additions should be placed on the rear so they have minimal impact and this does. It's interesting they're putting a new addition on but wanting to make it look old. The overall proportions of the new additions should be compatible with the existing structure. Since it's in the back and it's smaller, it is compatible. The design elements are also compatible. The roofing materials should be compatible with the existing materials. The new roof will not match but it's compatible and consistent with the guidelines and roofs in the historic district. The new additions should be constructed so that if removed in the future it will not cause reversible damage and it will be. It also should show a break between the original structure and the new addition but in this case, it will look historic like it was always meant to be there. The brick and the aluminum clad wood windows as well as the historic wood windows are all appropriate and fits the guidelines. The roof line for the new addition should be similar in form, pitch, and eave height. The proposed roof is a little different pitch but it's similar. The

Page 4 Historic District Board of Review August 2, 2023

foundation should be similar or compatible and again, this is not going to be similar but it is compatible. The project is in conformance.
O. McCall – I agree.
M. Pittman – I agree.
J. Wilber – I agree.
M. Zink – I agree.
K. McWilliams – I agree.
C. Rogers – I agree.

J. Wilber asked for a motion.

K. Mefford did ask the HDBR if they would consider including an option for either an egress window or a French door on the rear wall of the addition. J. Wilber stated the HDBR would have to approve one or the other, so if the applicants wished to change, they'd have to come back to the HDBR for approval on that change.

K. McWilliams made the following motion, "Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Keith Mefford and the Lindsay's at 719 W. Second St. to add a 15'x16' master bedroom addition on the rear. The materials are as follows: foundation will be stone, brick exterior, reusing the original back door as well as an original window, a standing seam roof, and an aluminum clad wood window."

Seconded by M. Pittman.

Roll Call:

M. Zink Approved

M. Pittman Approved

O. McCall Approved

K. McWilliams Approved

C. Rogers Approved

J. Wilber Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

Old/New Business:

J. Wilber discussed the updated approval guidelines and asked B. Peach what measures were in place to ensure the staff member, regardless of who that might be, would follow all appropriate guidelines and ordinances. B. Peach stated the way the approval guidelines for staff review were written, any application that receives approval must follow both or be referred to the HDBR for full Board review.

K. McWilliams made a motion to approve the updated approval guidelines.

Seconded by M. Pittman.

J. Wilber Approved

M. Pittman Approved

M. Zink Approved

O. McCall Approved

Page 5 Historic District Board of Review August 2, 2023

K. McWilliams Approved

C. Rogers Approved

Staff Report:

July 2023 Fast-Track Applications

Applicant	Address	COA
Darrell Summers	811 E. First St.	replace existing aluminum siding with LP smart siding; replace rear west side non-historic door with new wood 1/2 lite door; replace rear existing non-historic French doors with new wood French doors; replace existing non-historic windows with 6/6 aluminum clad wood windows
Theresa Hitchcock	323 E. Main St.	install 4'x4' wood sign at right angle on building
Jeff Matheney	708 E. Second St.	Install full-view storm doors on front & front side door; install fabric awning above front door & transom
Rachel Fox	129 E. Main St.	Install vinyl signage on front windows; install polymetal sign at right angle on front of building

July 2022 COA Review

Applicant	Address	COA	Completion Status
Lyle & Michele Pennington	227 W. Main St.	Install sign on window & on front of building at right angle	Yes
Catherine Burress	410 W. Second St.	Install privacy fence in rear yard	Yes

Page 6 Historic District Board of Review August 2, 2023

Sandy Bailey	736 W. Third St.	Replace vinyl shutters with wood shutters	No
Scott Axline	214 E. Third St.	Install a vinyl window on third floor	Yes
Elyse Detmer	104 E. Third St.	Replace a standing seam metal roof with asphalt shingle roof	Yes
Raymond & Donna Godward	513 W. Main St.	Replace the windows, doors, & steps on the rear porch addition	Yes
Riverfront Development	120+ E. Vaughn Dr.	Build new viewing platform	In progress
Kevin Watkins	222 W. Second St.	Replace wood windows on front with aluminum clad windows	Yes
Pamela Brown	620 West St.	Build a new front porch & rear two-story addition	No
Carl Adkins	1016 W. First St.	Demolish a non-historic accessory building	Yes
Todd Calvert	1016 W. Main St.	Build a new rear addition & porch	In progress

M. Zink made a motion to adjourn the meeting – seconded by C. Rogers.

Meeting adjourned at 6:27 p.m.

BY ORDER OF THE MADISON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

Josh Wilber, Chairman	
Brooke Peach	
Historic Preservationist	