

HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

Minutes

April 22, 2024

The Madison City Historic District Board of Review held the regularly scheduled meeting on Monday, April 22, 2024 at 5:30 p.m. at 101 W. Main Street. Mike Pittman presided over the meeting with the following members present: Happy Smith, Ken McWilliams, Carol Ann Rogers, Jed Skillman, and William Jewell. Also present was Nicole M Schell – Director of Planning.

N. Schell noted that William Jewell was attending the meeting as a new member but would not be participating in tonight's meeting.

M. Pittman gave an overview of what to expect for those who have never been to a Historic District Board of Review meeting. Once the application is announced the applicant or representative will come up to the microphone to answer any questions. N. Schell will present the particulars on the project. The board will then go through a list of items to see if they meet the guidelines. M. Pittman added that at the end of each application, the board will vote.

3/25/2024 Minutes:

M. Pittman asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting on March 25, 2024, and had any corrections or additions.

K. McWilliams moved to approve the minutes. Seconded by H. Smith.

Roll Call:

M. Pittman	Approved
H. Smith	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
C. Rogers	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved

Minutes stand approved.

Applications:

1. Andy Crabtree – C. of A. to replace aluminum siding with vinyl siding. Replace shingle roof with metal roof. Replace wood windows with vinyl windows.
Location: 1018 Park Ave
Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

N. Schell showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Andy Crabtree was present.

A. Crabtree explained that six windows have broken glass and water damage. The siding has black insulation board underneath and no evidence of lapboard construction. The proposed metal roof will be a v rib style roof.

H. Smith asked for clarification on the roof type. A. Crabtree stated it was not corrugated but would have two ribs on either side of a center rib that are about 8 inches apart.

C. Rogers noted that several surrounding buildings within that part of town already have vinyl siding.

M. Pittman asked for public comment.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
<p>3.0 MATERIALS, WOOD SIDING AND SHINGLES</p>	<p>44-48</p>	<p><i>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines</i> – 3.0 MATERIALS, WOOD SIDING AND SHINGLES p. 44-48</p> <p>3.8 The use of vinyl or aluminum siding or trim is not appropriate.</p> <p>3.9 The use of fiber cement (cementitious) siding may be approved for replacement of deteriorated wood siding, new structures, non-historic structures and additions to historic structures not visible from the public view.</p>
<p>15.0 ROOFS</p>	<p>71-73</p>	<p><i>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines</i> – 15.0 ROOFS p. 71-73</p> <p>15.1 Preserve original and significant later roof forms, shapes, and major roof architectural elements such as dormers, gables, chimneys, and eave overhangs.</p>
<p>18.0 WINDOWS</p>	<p>82-86</p>	<p>15.4 New roofing materials should be compatible with either the existing or original roofing material.</p> <p><i>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines</i> – 18.0 WINDOWS p. 82-86</p> <p>18.1 Retain and preserve historic windows including all significant related elements such as frames, sashes, shutters, hardware, old glass, sills, trim and moldings.</p> <p>18.2 Maintain existing historic windows where possible.</p> <p>18.3 Repair existing historic windows where possible, rather than replacing entire window units.</p> <p>18.4 Replace in kind, using replacement windows that match the existing historic elements as closely as possible.</p> <p>18.7 New windows must match the originals in overall size and opening area and should have three dimensional muntins with either true divided lights (TDL) or simulated divided lights (SDL) which have three dimensional grilles on both the interior and exterior sides and a shadow bar between the panes.</p> <p><i>J. Skillman</i> – I see your point of view from an economic standpoint. Another house next door and the two across the street have gone to vinyl sidings, but it's out of code. However, I think you are making a lateral move and are improving the house.</p> <p><i>H. Smith</i> – The application does not meet guidelines. These guidelines are intended to preserve all of our historic structures in town. Your building is, of course, a later building. We don't have control over what happened in the past. We do like to try and encourage people to do the best they can, in terms of honoring the historic district, you're on one of the entryways into Madison.</p> <p><i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree that the guidelines as they are written, uh, per se, it may not meet that guideline. I have to agree with Jed in that putting that building back into a livable condition. And even though it doesn't specifically meet the guidelines, I think because the house is a non-contributing and a newer house, that he should be allowed to put the vinyl on it.</p> <p><i>K. McWilliams</i> – It does not meet the guidelines but I appreciate the work being done on this structure.</p> <p><i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree with Ken. You are making a significant improvement and investment in this property.</p>

Page 3
 Historic District Board of Review
 April 22, 2024

M. Pittman asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion, "Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a certificate of appropriateness to Mr. Crabtree for his home at 1018 Park Ave."

Seconded by C. Rogers.

Roll Call:

M. Pittman Approved
 H. Smith Approved
 K. McWilliams Approved
 C. Rogers Approved
 J. Skillman Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 2. Donnie Vaughn – C. of A. to build a 15-ft x 15-ft wood gazebo with stone fireplace in the backyard.
 Location: 710 W Second
 Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

N. Schell showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Donnie Vaughn was not present at the beginning of the meeting but appeared later during the meeting. N. Schell noted that the gazebo would be minimally visible over the privacy fence.

D. Vaughn stated he would be moving the current gazebo behind the house which will not be visible. H. Smith commended the applicant on the completeness of the drawing.

M. Pittman asked for public comment.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
22.0 POOLS, FOUNTAINS GAZEBOS AND PERGOLAS	93	<p>HDBR Guidelines: <i>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines – 22.0 POOLS, FOUNTAINS GAZEBOS AND PERGOLAS p. 93</i></p> <p>22.1 Gazebos and pergolas should be constructed of wood and painted in colors that complement the adjoining building. 22.2 Gazebos and pergolas should not obscure views or damage historic features of the adjoining building. 22.3 Gazebos and pergolas should be located out of or with limited public view.</p> <p><i>C. Rogers</i> - I agree that it's compatible and meets the ordinance. <i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>J. Skillman</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>H. Smith</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p>

M. Pittman asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion, "Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a certificate of appropriateness to Donnie Vaughn to build a 15 by 15 wood gazebo with a stone fireplace at 710 West Second Street."

Seconded by C. Rogers.

Roll Call:

- M. Pittman Approved
- H. Smith Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved
- C. Rogers Approved
- J. Skillman Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 3. Judy Stacier – C. of A. to install 9-ft x 12-ft metal gazebo and a 10-ft x 13-ft deck in the backyard.
 Location: 518 E Second St
 Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

N. Schell showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Judy Stacier was present.

K. McWilliams asked about the visibility of this structure. J. Stacier explained that it was located in the side yard and would be visible from Second Street but not the alley.

M. Pittman asked for public comment.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
<p>22.0 POOLS, FOUNTAINS GAZEBOS AND PERGOLAS</p> <p>27.0 NEW CONSTRUCTION – DECKS</p>	<p>93</p> <p>109</p>	<p>HDBR Guidelines: <i>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines – 22.0 POOLS, FOUNTAINS GAZEBOS AND PERGOLAS p. 93</i> 22.1 Gazebos and pergolas should be constructed of wood and painted in colors that complement the adjoining building. 22.2 Gazebos and pergolas should not obscure views or damage historic features of the adjoining building. 22.3 Gazebos and pergolas should be located out of or with limited public view.</p> <p><i>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines – 27.0 NEW CONSTRUCTION – DECKS p. 109</i> 27.1 Locate decks only on the rear ground level of historic buildings or other ground floor level where the deck is not visible from public view. 27.2 Design decks to eliminate physical or visual damage to significant historic architectural features.</p>

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
22.0 POOLS, FOUNTAINS GAZEBOS AND PERGOLAS	93	<i>Madison Historic District Design Guidelines – 27.0 NEW CONSTRUCTION – DECKS</i> p. 109 27.3 Decks should be attached to the historic building so that they may be removed without significant damage. 27.4 Provide proper flashing and other details to reduce or eliminate moisture damage to the historic structure.
27.0 NEW CONSTRUCTION – DECKS	109	<i>H. Smith</i> – I think this project does meet the guidelines. In reference to 22.1, it's saying that they should be constructed of wood, so perhaps it does not meet that guideline. You absolutely meet the rest of the guidelines. Decks are going to be on the rear of a historic building. You meet that guideline. The deck is not being attached to your building. I think essentially for this board, it meets the guidelines sufficiently. <i>J. Skillman</i> – I think it meets the guidelines. <i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree with H. Smith for the same reasons. <i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree for the same reasons.

M. Pittman asked for a motion. H. Smith made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a certificate of appropriateness to Judy Stacier for the proposed deck and gazebo, located at the rear of 518 East second Street.”

Seconded by K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

- M. Pittman Approved
- H. Smith Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved
- C. Rogers Approved
- J. Skillman Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 4. Brian Marshall - C. of A. to build a 40-ft x 47-ft pole barn.
 Location: 108 W 5th St (rear of 701-703 West St)
 Zoned: Central Business District (CBD)

N. Schell showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Brian Marshall was present.

B. Marshall noted the garage door would be a metal overhead door with wood graining to match the entry door. H. Smith noted that the size of the proposed garage was very large compared to standard garages of 20x20. The lot is 54-ft in length and the proposed garage is 47-ft long.

H. Smith asked about the ridge height. B. Marshall stated he believed it would be around 18-ft. K. McWilliams asked about the garage door height. B. Marshall stated it would be 16-ft wide and 7-ft tall. B. Marshall noted that the building would sit 20-ft off the buildings located at 701 and 703 West St.

Page 6
 Historic District Board of Review
 April 22, 2024

M. McWilliams stated the design is not compatible with the district. M. Pittman asked about the stone material. B. Marshall stated it would be faux stone. H. Smith and J. Skillman both addressed the condition and materials of the surrounding buildings. M. Pittman asked about alternative materials. B. Marshall stated he could put LP smart siding on the front.

M. Pittman asked the applicant if he would be willing to consider tabling the application and coming back with a new design. B. Marshall agreed.

M. Pittman asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the motion to table the application until the next meeting."

Seconded by M. Pittman.

Roll Call:

M. Pittman	Approved
H. Smith	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
C. Rogers	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved as amended. A Certificate will be issued for the amended project.

New Business:

N. Schell invited Park Director Scott Klein to speak about the proposed project at Hargen Matthews Park. S. Klein described the sunshade structure project at the park. S. Klein stated the structure would be 11-ft in height on one side and 9-ft in height on the other. The sunshade will only be up during the summer month and be taken down during the winter for storage.

M. Pittman asked about the wind rating. S. Klein shared drawings showing the window loads of the structure. K. McWilliams asked about the dimensions of the structure. S. Klein stated it would be approximately 20-ft 10-inch square. M. Pittman asked about the material. S. Klein stated it would be canvas or sail material.

K. McWilliams asked about next steps. N. Schell stated since this park is located downtown, she wanted to bring the structure to this board's attention but didn't think the board needed to do anything formal unless there are objections. The board showed no objections to the project.

Old Business:

N. Schell read the proposed amendment to the rules of procedure.

Amendment to the section titled: "Notice:" under CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS to read as follows:

Before the regular meeting, applicants shall post signs obtained from the Office of Planning, Preservation, & Design, which announce the date, time, and location of the Historic Board of Review meeting and the applicant's proposed changes as published in the appropriate legal notice. The sign shall also contain language which specifies that the meeting is open to all residents of Madison who wish to attend. Signs shall be posted at the property for 15 days immediately before the meeting and must be visible from all adjoining public streets and alleys.

Page 7
Historic District Board of Review
April 22, 2024

A fee of \$2.00 per sign will be charged to the applicant at the time of filing. If the application is deemed incomplete for the meeting for which the signs were issued, new signs shall be posted following the same procedure and fee as listed above.

M. Pittman made the following motion, "I move that the HDBR approve the Rule of Procedure amendment to charge a fee of \$2 per sign if the application is deemed incomplete."

Seconded by H. Smith.

Roll Call:

M. Pittman	Approved
H. Smith	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
C. Rogers	Approved
J. Skillman	Approved

Staff Report:

April 2024 Fast-Track Applications

Applicant	Address	COA
Michael Armstrong	1047 W Main St	fence
Paul Lee	820 W Main St	windows; doors; gutters; fences; porches; siding; lighting
David Jackson	915 W First St	siding
Larry Ikerd	120 E Second St	lighting; sign
Kelly Knight	414 East St	fence

April 2023 COA Review

Applicant	Address	COA	Completion Status
Smith, Robb & Marci	902 E. First St.	accessory building	Yes
McCloskey, Jeremy	815 E. First St.	solar panels	No
Benham, James	1103 W. Main St.	doors, architectural elements	No
Godward, Joe	513 W. Main St.	windows, awnings	Yes
Sharpe, Devon	718 W. Main St.	window	Yes
Rogers, Ryan	921 W. First St.	addition	In progress
Ohlendorf, Bill & Susan	407 W. Second St.	siding, roof, doors, windows	In progress
Zullo, Angelo & Mirta	1218 W. Main St.	accessory building	Yes

C. Rogers made a motion to adjourn the meeting – seconded by K. McWilliams.

Meeting adjourned at 6:27 p.m.

BY ORDER OF THE MADISON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

Mike Pittman, Chairman

Nicole M Schell, Director of Planning