

HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

Minutes

April 5, 2023

The Madison City Historic District Board of Review held the rescheduled meeting originally scheduled for Monday, March 27, 2023 on Wednesday, April 5, 2023 at 5:30 p.m. at 101 W. Main Street. Mike Pittman presided over the meeting with the following members present: Josh Wilber (via Microsoft Teams), Owen McCall, Sandy Palmer, Michael Zink, and Ken McWilliams. Also present was Devon Sharpe – HDBR Attorney and Brooke Peach – Historic Preservationist.

M. Pittman gave an overview of what to expect for those who have never been to a Historic District Board of Review meeting. Once the application is announced the applicant or representative will come up to the microphone to answer any questions. B. Peach will present the particulars on the project. The board will then go through a list of items to see if they meet the guidelines. M. Pittman added that at the end of each application the board will vote.

2/27/2023 Minutes:

M. Pittman asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting for February 27, 2023 and had any corrections or additions.

S. Palmer moved to approve the minutes. Seconded by M. Pittman.

Roll Call:

M. Pittman	Approved
J. Wilber	Abstain
O. McCall	Approved
S. Palmer	Approved
M. Zink	Abstain
K. McWilliams	Abstain

Minutes stand approved.

Applications:

1. Robb & Marci Smith – C. of A. to build a 24'x24' garage with 2 overhead doors, standard door, and window(s); materials to be finalized but will include either wood/cement siding.

Location: **902 E. First St.**

Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**

B. Peach declared the application incomplete due to no representation present after second calling.

2. Emeka Koren – C. of A. to reconfigure south wall so that basement entry becomes.

Location: **760 W. Third St.**

Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Emeka Koren was present.

E. Koren stated the solar panels had to go on the front roof elevation but that the roof was not readily visible from most angles, so they would not affect the historic character of the property. M. Zink asked how close the panels would be to the roof. E. Koren stated they would have about a total 2.5" height and be about 1' from the edge of the roof. K. McWilliams asked how the cells were connected and E. Koren stated the wires would connect to the rear of the home and would not be visible.

Page 2
Historic District Board of Review
April 5, 2023

M. Pittman asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
29.0 New Construction – Energy Retrofits		<p>K. <i>McWilliams</i> – The guidelines recommend solar panels be located in a place where they will not be readily visible, will not alter the historic character, and the hardware is not readily visible. You’ve stated all of the conditions are met, so I find this project in conformance.</p> <p>O. <i>McCall</i> – I agree.</p> <p>S. <i>Palmer</i> – I agree.</p> <p>M. <i>Pittman</i> – I agree.</p> <p>M. <i>Zink</i> – I agree.</p> <p>J. <i>Wilber</i> – I agree.</p> <p>C. <i>Rogers</i> – I agree.</p>

M. Pittman asked for a motion. S. Palmer made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Emeka Koren to install solar panels on the south face of the roof.”

Seconded by K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

J. Wilber Approved

S. Palmer Approved

M. Pittman Approved

O. McCall Approved

K. McWilliams Approved

M. Zink Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

3. Josh Wilber – C. of A. to replace existing tile roof with Brava synthetic cedar shingle style roof.

Location: **506 W. Main St.**

Zoned: **Specialty District (SD)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Josh Wilber and Joel Storm were present.

J. Wilber stated his original tile roof had been damaged in a hailstorm five years previous and he’d been investigating roofing materials. Due to the cost of terra cotta tile roofing and the architectural styling of the home, he opted for the Brava synthetic product. B. Peach showed sample material to the HDDR. Several Board members asked which size shingle J. Wilber was proposing to use. J. Storm stated the shingle would be of varied sizes rather than of uniform size to mimic traditional cedar shingle roof. J. Wilber stated B. Peach had helped research the use of the product within other historic districts. B. Peach stated the proposed product had been approved in other historic districts and passed copies of emails from National Alliance of Preservation Commissions list serv regarding the proposed product.

S. Palmer asked what the estimated cost of the tile replacement and J. Wilber stated it was nearly \$300,000. J. Storm and J. Wilber stated the cost of the proposed product was significantly less.

Page 3
 Historic District Board of Review
 April 5, 2023

M. Pittman asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
15.0 Roofs	71-73	<p><i>O. McCall</i> – The guidelines discuss replacing historic roofing material, but historically we cannot force people to replace extremely expensive materials. Only damaged portions should be replaced, but in this case, the roof is so damaged, it must be completely replaced.</p> <p><i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>M. Zink</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>J. Wilber</i> – Abstain.</p> <p><i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree.</p>

M. Pittman asked for a motion. O. McCall made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Josh Wilber to install a synthetic cedar shingle roof.”

Seconded by K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

J. Wilber Abstain

S. Palmer Approved

M. Pittman Approved

O. McCall Approved

K. McWilliams Approved

M. Zink Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

3. Marcus Gray – C. of A. to build a 6’4”x16’3” front porch with roof.
 Location: 124 East St. Zoned: **Historic District Residential**)

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. M. Gray was present.

M. Gray stated he thought the porch was included in the COAs obtained in 2021 and 2022, so the porch was built already. S. Palmer asked if the house originally had a porch and M. Gray stated it did but that the porch was on the side. O. McCall stated the front porch appeared appropriate to the home’s design.

M. Pittman asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Page 4
 Historic District Board of Review
 April 5, 2023

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
29.0 New Construction – Additions		<p><i>S. Palmer</i> – The guidelines suggest a porch should only be added if it is appropriate to the style of home. This porch is compatible and in conformance although it violates the ordinance which requires a COA.</p> <p><i>O. McCall</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>M. Zink</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree.</p>

M. Pittman asked for a motion. O. McCall made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Marcus Gray for the porch addition at 124 East St.”

Seconded by K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

J. Wilber Approved

S. Palmer Deny

M. Pittman Approved

O. McCall Approved

K. McWilliams Approved

M. Zink Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

4. Jeremy McCloskey – C. of A. to install solar panels on the rear roof elevation.
 Location: **815 E. First St.** Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**

B. Peach declared the application incomplete due to no representation present after second calling.

5. Joel Storm – C. of A. to replace existing Cementous siding with Dutch-lap vinyl siding.
 Location: **810 E. Second St.** Zoned: **HDR (Historic District Residential)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Joel Storm and Mark Timmons was present.

K. McWilliams asked what the previously issued COA was for. B. Peach stated the December 2022 COA was to replace aluminum siding with Cementous siding, but that staff was unaware of the fact the wood lap siding was underneath. M. Timmons stated the siding replacement was an insurance job, so the funding for the project was limited, so vinyl was the only option.

J. Storm stated it was his understanding materials could be replaced in-kind without approval, so he went with the insurance company’s determination that vinyl was in-kind to aluminum siding. J. Wilber clarified the application was to amend a previous COA on a job that was already completed. B. Peach explained the job was mostly done but not completed. A stop work order had been placed, so the project was not finished. J. Wilber asked J. Storm why he did not discuss the siding changes with staff prior to installing the vinyl siding. J. Storm stated the insurance determined aluminum and vinyl siding were like in-kind. J. Wilber and J. Storm agreed the two

Page 5
Historic District Board of Review
April 5, 2023

products were not like in-kind. M. Pittman asked if the historic wood siding had been removed and J. Storm said it had not.

M. Pittman asked for public comment and noted Lisa Ferguson. L. Ferguson stated she was supportive of the Timmons’ project because it was better to approve the siding than to allow it to remain incomplete due to the applicant’s funding constraints.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
3.0 Materials, Wood Siding & Shingles	44-48	<p>S. Palmer – The guidelines have ten elements that all advocate retaining and preserving the wood siding. When that wood siding cannot be preserved, Cementous siding should be used to replace it if it cannot be replaced with wood. Vinyl or aluminum siding should not be used. This project is not in conformance.</p> <p>O. McCall – I agree. K. McWilliams – I agree. M. Pittman – I agree. M. Zink – I recuse because I was party to a discussion regarding this siding prior to being appointed to this board. J. Wilber – I agree. The fact this application has come to us after the fact the different material was mostly put on makes this not a financial issue but something altogether different. C. Rogers – I agree.</p>

M. Pittman asked for a motion. O. McCall made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review deny a COA to install the vinyl siding.”

Seconded by S. Palmer.

Roll Call:

- J. Wilber Approved
- S. Palmer Approved
- M. Pittman Deny
- O. McCall Approved
- K. McWilliams Deny
- M. Zink Recuse

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 6. Riverside Group, LLC – C. of A. to build new 2BR/IBA home with 1 car garage & basement.

Location: **1010 E. First St.**

Zoned: **HDR (Historic District Residential)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Alex and Lisa Hammock were present.

Page 6
 Historic District Board of Review
 April 5, 2023

A. Hammock presented the HDDBR with a map of the parcels because it was different than what was shown on the GIS maps. K. McWilliams asked for clarification because the plans submitted show 2 bedrooms but the application shows 2. A. Hammock stated there would be 1 bedroom upstairs and there could be 1 in the basement but it would be determined if they would actually finish the 2nd bedroom. M. Pittman asked about the shape of the lot and A. Hammock stated this lot would have a rear neighbor and the lot would not extend to Vaughn Drive.

L. Hammock explained the site plan of where the driveway would be located and that the house would face First. S. Palmer asked how the proposed home's height and massing would compare to the neighboring home and L. Hammock stated it would be similar in height. She also noted they wanted to build a gable roof rather than a hipped roof to match the other homes on the street. K. McWilliams asked if the setbacks would be at least 3' and L. Hammock agreed it would exceed that.

M. Pittman asked for public comment and noted Patrick Thevenow. P. Thevenow asked about the parcel sizes differed from the plat to GIS and L. Hammock showed him the map she submitted to the HDDBR. M. Pittman also recognized Tracy K. Green. She asked about the specific window and door materials. M. Pittman stated the new building materials do not need to match the historic materials of nearby homes but that the material would be compatible to the historic district and new construction. L. Hammock also stated the materials would conform to historic district guidelines for materials. B. Peach also noted she'd received an email that had been distributed to the HDDBR prior to the meeting.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
23.0 New Construction - Dwellings	94-100	<p>K. McWilliams – The guidelines have twelve elements to look at regarding new homes. After looking at each of the guidelines, this project is compatible with the neighborhood and is compatible with the guidelines.</p> <p>O. McCall – I agree.</p> <p>K. McWilliams – I agree.</p> <p>M. Pittman – I agree.</p> <p>M. Zink – I agree.</p> <p>J. Wilber – I agree.</p> <p>C. Rogers – I agree.</p>

M. Pittman asked for a motion. S. Palmer made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to the Riverside Group for the home at 1010 E. First St.”

Seconded by K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

J. Wilber Approved

S. Palmer Approved

M. Pittman Approved

O. McCall Approved

K. McWilliams Approved

M. Zink Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project

Page 6
 Historic District Board of Review
 April 5, 2023

K. McWilliams moved to amend the motion to include a gable roof, aluminum clad windows, and compatible siding materials. Seconded by S. Palmer.

Roll Call:

- J. Wilber Approved
- S. Palmer Approved
- M. Pittman Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved
- M. Zink Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 7. Riverside Group, LLC – C. of A. to build new 2BR/1BA home with 1 car garage & basement.

Location: **1016 E. First St.**

Zoned: **HDR (Historic District Residential)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Alex and Lisa Hammock were present.

A. Hammock stated they wanted to make it a 3 bedroom 2.5 bath home. L. Hammock stated they did want a rear deck on the home. She also explained the home would have LP siding and stone or brick and aluminum clad windows. M. Pittman asked if the front porch would have railing and L. Hammock stated there would be no railing because it would not be high enough to require one.

M. Pittman asked for public comment and noted T. Green who asked if the home would be in the flood-plain. A. Hammock stated the home would be about 14-20’ from the street and about 51’ to the rear property line and would face First St.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
23.0 New Construction -Dwellings	94-100	S. Palmer – This project is compatible with the guidelines because the set-backs, height, and materials. O. McCall – I agree. K. McWilliams – I agree. M. Pittman – I agree. M. Zink – I agree. J. Wilber – I agree.

M. Pittman asked for a motion. S. Palmer made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to the Riverside Group for the home at 1016 E. First St. as submitted including aluminum clad wood windows and a porch with roof on the rear.”

Seconded by O. McCall.

Roll Call:

Page 7
Historic District Board of Review
April 5, 2023

- J. Wilber Approved
- S. Palmer Approved
- M. Pittman Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved
- M. Zink Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

8. Riverside Group, LLC – C. of A. to build new 3BR/2.5BA home with 1 car garage & basement.
Location: **1016 E. First St.** Zoned: **HDR (Historic District Residential)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Alex and Lisa Hammock were present.

L. Hammock stated they did want a rear deck on the home. She also explained the home would have LP siding and stone or brick and aluminum clad windows. M. Pittman asked if the front porch would have railing and L. Hammock stated there would be no railing because it would not be high enough to require one.

M. Pittman asked for public comment and noted T. Green who asked if the home would be in the flood plain. A. Hammock stated the home would be about 14-20’ from the street and about 51’ to the rear property line and would face First St.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
23.0 New Construction - Dwellings	94-100	S. Palmer – This project is compatible with the guidelines because the set-backs, height, and materials. O. McCall – I agree. K. McWilliams – I agree. M. Pittman – I agree. M. Zink – I agree. J. Wilber – I agree.

M. Pittman asked for a motion. S. Palmer made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to the Riverside Group for the home at 1016 E. First St. as submitted including aluminum clad wood windows and a porch with roof on the rear.”

Seconded by O. McCall.

Roll Call:

- J. Wilber Approved
- S. Palmer Approved
- M. Pittman Approved

Page 7
 Historic District Board of Review
 April 5, 2023

O. McCall Approved
 K. McWilliams Approved
 M. Zink Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

9. Riverside Group, LLC – C. of A. to build new 3BR/2.5BA home with 1 car garage & basement.

Location: **1016 E. First St.** Zoned: **HDR (Historic District Residential)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Alex and Lisa Hammock were present.

A. Hammock stated they would be applying for a new address. L. Hammock stated they would have to build the rear elevation up due to the topography but the front elevation would be comparable to the other homes. The garage door will be located on the front due to the lack of practical access to the rear but a small garage door for a golf cart or lawn equipment on the rear.

O. McCall asked if this home would look more modern than the others and A. Hammock stated it would because they had a potential buyer that desired this aesthetic look. A. Hammock stated the materials would remain the same but the design is different and the siding would be board and batten rather than

M. Pittman asked for public comment and noted P. Thevenow. He asked what the approximate elevation of the roofline would be. L. Hammock stated 9’ plus the roof. Tony Hammock was also recognized. He stated the roof would be 6/12 pitch and 9’ walls.

T. Green was also recognized and asked how close the home would be to the neighbors in relation to the height and if the home would be in the flood zone. M. Pittman stated the building inspector would address any potential flood issues. L. Hammock stated the height would be comparable to nearby houses.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
23.0 New Construction - Dwellings	94-100	<p><i>O. McCall</i> – The set-backs, height, scale, and massing are appropriate. The windows and doors should be compatible to contributing buildings along the block. This proposed structure’s windows & doors are not compatible. The other materials are compatible. The number of door & window openings are also compatible. Overall, this project is in conformance.</p> <p><i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree. <i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree. <i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree. <i>M. Zink</i> – I agree. <i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree.</p>

M. Pittman asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to the Riverside Group to build a home on two parcels at 1016 E. First St. as submitted including aluminum clad wood windows, LP siding and stone or brick, and a deck on the rear.”

Seconded by S. Palmer.

Roll Call:

J. Wilber Approved

Page 8

Historic District Board of Review
April 5, 2023

- S. Palmer Approved
- M. Pittman Approved
- O. McCall Deny
- K. McWilliams Approved
- M. Zink Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

10. Kimberly Mullins – C. of A. to build new garage at the rear of the property.
Location: **770 W. Third St.** Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**

B. Peach stated the applicant requested to table the application to the April meeting.

Old/New Business:

B. Peach asked for any comments from the HDDR regarding the proposed guidelines review guide, noted this was the second meeting the review guide was discussed, and reminded the HDDR it could be voted on at the next meeting.

B. Peach also discussed awards for preservation month.

K. McWilliams proposed the Chairman to assign applications to HDDR members prior to each meeting so that members would be assigned for the findings of fact and know which applications in advance. M. Pittman objected stating members should be prepared for every application. Discussion was tabled until April meeting.

Staff Report:

March 2023 Fast-Track Applications

Applicant	Address	COA
Brooke Newby	620 Jefferson	Replace existing replacement wood windows w/ aluminum clad wood windows
Steve Miner	723 E. First St.	Replace existing deteriorated wood windows w/ aluminum clad wood windows
Kathryn Rutherford	423 W. Main St.	Install 4'x4' sign above front door
Gina Lynn	214 W. Second	Install black metal fence in rear yard between house & garage
Paula Bell	229 W. Main St.	Install sign

Central Holdings	510 Mulberry	Replace 2 existing deteriorated wood windows w/ aluminum clad wood windows
Jacqueline Frazer	606 W. Third St.	Replace existing replacement front door & storm door w/ new front door & storm door
Julie Brown	623 Broadway St.	Replace existing vinyl siding with Cementous siding; replace existing replacement windows w/ aluminum clad wood windows
Brooke Newby	620 Jefferson St.	replace chain link fence & install wood privacy fence in rear yard to be 6' tall & 70' in total length with 1 gate of same material

March 2022 COA Review

Applicant	Address	COA	Completion Status
Brian Marshall	411 Dowell St.	Build 8'x24' addition on the southeast corner of the structure using vinyl windows, standing seam roof, & fiberglass doors	In progress
Sarah Renfro	118 Ferry St.	Close 2 entrances & cover with Hardie board siding on front, leaving other 3 sides stucco, & install vinyl windows	In progress
Sarah Grey	312 W. Third St.	Install fiber cement lap siding on existing addition & gable peak of garage; installation of wood & shingle awnings on 2 patio doors	Yes
Sarah Renfro	118 Ferry St.	Replace existing T-11 siding with Hardie board siding	Yes
Kim Kidwell Lytle	314 W. Main St.	Remove aluminum awnings; remove non-wood lap siding installed on transoms & replace it with glass & original transoms or wood & glass	Yes
Brian Marshall	411 Dowell St.	replace existing T 1-11 siding with LP smart siding; replace the shingle roof with a standing seam metal roof; replace existing windows with	In progress - (windows modified by HDBR COA)

new aluminum clad wood windows of the same size and shape

David Cheatham & Amy Eberwine 815-17 W. Second St.

Withdrawn by applicants

replace standing seam roof, if repair is not possible, with an architectural shingle roof to revert back to the original historic appearance of the roof as indicated on the 1886 Sanborn Map; replace deteriorated wood windows with aluminum clad windows of the same size and 6/6 pane configuration (sides & rear only), saving any historic window that can be repaired (including each on the front façade); install smooth cement board or wood siding in areas the historic wood siding cannot be repaired (sides & rear only)

Paul & Teresa Walters 618 E. Second St.


Install a 5"x10" bronze sign by the front door Yes

S. Palmer made a motion to adjourn the meeting – seconded by M. Zink.

Meeting adjourned at 7:48 p.m.

BY ORDER OF THE MADISON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW


Mike Pittman, Vice-Chairman


Brooke Peach
Historic Preservationist