

HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

Minutes

June 26, 2023

The Madison City Historic District Board of Review held a meeting on Monday, June 26, 2023 at 5:30 p.m. at 101 W. Main Street. Mike Pittman presided over the meeting with the following members present: Ken McWilliams, Owen McCall, Sandy Palmer, Carol Ann Rogers, and Michael Zink. Also present was Brooke Peach – Historic Preservationist.

M. Pittman gave an overview of what to expect for those who have never been to a Historic District Board of Review meeting. Once the application is announced the applicant or representative will come up to the microphone to answer any questions. B. Peach will present the particulars on the project. The board will then go through a list of items to see if they meet the guidelines. M. Pittman added that at the end of each application the board will vote.

5/22/2023 Minutes:

M. Pittman asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting for May 22, 2023 and had any corrections or additions.

K. McWilliams moved to approve the minutes. Seconded by S. Palmer.

Roll Call:

M. Pittman Approved

M. Zink Abstain

O. McCall Approved

S. Palmer Approved

C. Rogers Approved

K. McWilliams Approved

Minutes stand approved.

Applications:

1. Samantha Greer – C. of A. to replace existing shingle roof on garage w/ exposed fastener metal roof to match primary structure.

Location: **410 E. Second St.**

Zoned: **Central Business District (CBD)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Samantha Greer was present.

S. Greer stated the new metal roof would match the existing roof on the house.

M. Pittman asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
15.0 Roofs	71-73	<p><i>M. Zink</i> – The new garage roof will match the roof on the primary structure, so it is in conformance with the guidelines.</p> <p><i>O. McCall</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree.</p> <p><i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree.</p>

Page 2
Historic District Board of Review
June 26, 2023

M. Pittman asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Samantha Greer to replace the existing shingle roof with an exposed fastener roof on the garage at 410 E. Second St.”

Seconded by C. Rogers.

Roll Call:

J. Wilber Approved
S. Palmer Approved
M. Pittman Approved
O. McCall Approved
C. Rogers Approved
J. Wilber Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

2. Kathryn Rutherford – C. of A. to replace existing double-door with single wooden door with sidelites on each side; replace side door w/ wood & glass door.
Zoned: **Specialty District (SD)**
Location: **423 W. Main St.**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Kathryn Rutherford was present.

K. Rutherford stated the Elm St. side door was deteriorated and unable to be repaired but also pointed out it was not original to the structure. S. Palmer and O. McCall noted the proposed side door did not match the structure’s architectural design. K. Rutherford stated she liked the door but was willing to have another lite configuration put into it so that it would more closely align to the building’s style.

M. Pittman asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
9.0 Doors & Entrances	59-61	<i>K. McWilliams</i> – Replacement doors should be in keeping with the style and period of the building. The front door is in conformance and with the changes proposed to the side door, it is in conformance as well. <i>O. McCall</i> – I agree. <i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree. <i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree. <i>M. Zink</i> – I agree. <i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree.

M. Pittman asked for a motion. S. Palmer made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Kathryn Rutherford for the replacement of the double doors on the front with a single wood and glass door with sidelites and a wood and glass door, with the proposed modifications as discussed, on the Elm St. side at 423 W. Main St.”

Seconded by C. Rogers.

Page 3
 Historic District Board of Review
 June 26, 2023

Roll Call:

M. Zink Approved
 S. Palmer Approved
 M. Pittman Approved
 O. McCall Approved
 K. McWilliams Approved
 C. Rogers Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

3. Van Crafton – C. of A. to complete rehabilitation which will include shingle roof, box gutters, sun brand windows, LP smart siding; we will not be changing the current structure or footprint of the home.

Location: **912 W. First St.**

Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**

B. Peach noted the application had been withdrawn per applicant request because there was no need to rebuild the exterior wall.

4. Link Ludington – C. of A. to complete rehabilitation which will include shingle roof, box gutters, sun brand windows, LP smart siding; we will not be changing the current structure or footprint of the home.

Location: **611 Mulberry St.**

Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**

B. Peach noted the application had been withdrawn per applicant request because there was no need to rebuild the exterior wall.

5. Link Ludington – C. of A. to relocate the house to the northeast corner of the property & with the addition of a deck and garage with door access.

Location: **611 Mulberry St.**

Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Link Ludington was present.

L. Ludington gave a history of the structure and noted the fact it had been previously moved to save it from demolition. He also explained the new foundation that would include a garage space with walk-out exterior access on the rear that would be similar to rear garages sited on nearby properties. C. Rogers asked if the exterior of the home would be redone and B. Peach and L. Ludington explained the restoration would be as outlined in the PACE application included in the packet and would involve restoration over replacement.

M. Pittman asked for public comment and noted T. Kay. T. Kay asked about the existing stone retaining wall, site plan, and garage setbacks. L. Ludington stated the house would be located to match the existing setbacks of the other homes on the street.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
31.0 Relocation	115	C. Rogers – The guidelines say relocation should take place as a last resort to demolition, but this relocation will save the building

Page 4
 Historic District Board of Review
 June 26, 2023

		<p>and put it in a more appropriate place. The application has already documented everything thoroughly. The house will be moved as a single unit and will be relocated in the historic district. The new site plan is compatible to other structures along the street and the new foundation will also be compatible with others nearby. <i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree. <i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree. <i>O. McCall</i> – I agree. <i>M. Zink</i> – I agree. <i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree.</p>
--	--	---

J. Wilber asked for a motion. C. Rogers made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Link Ludington to relocate the house at 111 E. Fourth St. to 611 Mulberry St., adding a CMU foundation with a garage, door access, and a deck.”

Seconded by K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

M. Zink	Approved
S. Palmer	Approved
M. Pittman	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved
C. Rogers	Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

6. Kimberly Mullins – C. of A. to build new 40’x25’ garage at the rear of the home to face Presbyterian.

Location: **770 W. Third St.**

Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Kimberly Mullins was present.

K. McWilliams asked K. Mullins to identify which of the two designs submitted she wanted to build and K. Mullins stated she preferred a basic metal pole barn style garage with a porch on the rear facing the house. K. Mullins also noted there were at least three other garages of the same style along Presbyterian.

M. Pittman asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
24.0 New Construction - Outbuildings	116-117	<p><i>O. McCall</i> – The guidelines state the new garage should blend with the architectural style and considering the house is a newer home and non-contributing, the style of the garage matches the house. The new garage will also have a compatible materials, massing, and siting with others nearby. There will be two garage doors rather than one, so that is in conformance also. <i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree. <i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree.</p>

Page 5
Historic District Board of Review
May 22, 2023

			M. Zink – I agree. J. Wilber – I agree. M. Pittman– I agree.
--	--	--	--

M. Pittman asked for a motion. O. McCall made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Kimberly Mullins for the proposed new garage as discussed without the side knockout at 770 W. Third St.”

Seconded by C. Rogers.

Roll Call:

- M. Zink Approved
- S. Palmer Approved
- M. Pittman Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved
- C. Rogers Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

7. Brian Marshall – C. of A. to demolish non-historic shed in the rear yard.

Location: **1003 East St.** Zoned: **Residential Medium Density (R-8)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Brian Marshall was present.

The HDBR did not have any questions but noted the accessory building was not historic and in very deteriorated condition.

J. Wilber asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
32.0 Roofs	71-73	K. <i>McWilliams</i> – The guidelines state demolitions of contributing buildings should be a last resort, but this is a non-contributing non-historic building that is extremely deteriorated. C. <i>Rogers</i> – I agree. S. <i>Palmer</i> – I agree. O. <i>McCall</i> – I agree. M. <i>Zink</i> – I agree. M. <i>Pittman</i> – I agree.

J. Wilber asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Brian Marshall for the demolition of the shed behind the house at 1003 East St.”

Seconded by M. Pittman.

Roll Call:

- M. Zink Approved
- S. Palmer Approved

Page 6
 Historic District Board of Review
 June 26, 2023

- M. Pittman Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved
- C. Rogers Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 8. Mike Prickett – C. of A. to build covered porch roof w/ lumber, EPDM rubber roofing, vinyl soffit, aluminum fascia, seamless aluminum gutters & wood siding; add stone fireplace & chimney.

Location: **919 W. First St.**

Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**

- B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Mike Prickett was present.
- M. Prickett stated the rock that will be used to construct the chimneys and fireplaces is repurposed rock from a historic rock house that was deconstructed in a nearby town. C. Rogers asked if the existing deck supports would be used and M. Prickett stated they would.
- M. Pittman asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
14.0 Porches	68-70	<i>M. Zink</i> – It is not appropriate to add a porch to the front of the home, but this will be added to the rear and will make it more in conformance to the other structures in the area. Similarly, it is not appropriate to add a chimney from a readily visible public view but this one will be located on the new porch and <i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree. <i>O. McCall</i> – I agree. <i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree. <i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree. <i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree.
8.0 Chimneys	57-58	

M. Pittman asked for a motion. M. Zink made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Mike Pettit for the construction of a covered porch roof made with lumber, EPDM rubber roofing, vinyl soffit, aluminum fascia, seamless aluminum gutters and composite or wood siding a stone fireplace and chimney.”

Seconded by K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

- M. Zink Approved
- S. Palmer Approved
- M. Pittman Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved

C. Rogers Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 9. Mike Prickett – C. of A. to build 22’x30’ detached garage on block foundation w/ standard framing, 6/12 roof pitch, LP Smartsiding, 2 Sun windows, 2 fiberglass doors & steel overhead garage door; remove existing vinyl siding & install LP Smartsiding.
 Location: **921 W. First St.** Zoned: **Historic District Residential (HDR)**

B. Peach showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Mike Prickett was present.

O. McCall verified the application included the removal of the existing vinyl siding on the primary structure and installation of LP SmartSiding and M. Prickett agreed it would.

M. Pittman asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
3.0 Wood Siding & Shingles	44-48	<i>K. McWilliams</i> – The removal of vinyl siding and replacement with LP is entirely appropriate and will benefit both the property and neighborhood. The guidelines state new outbuildings should be located on the rear or side and this one is. It will also be compatible to the house and have compatible materials. <i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree. <i>O. McCall</i> – I agree. <i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree. <i>M. Pittman</i> – I agree. <i>M. Zink</i> – I agree. <i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree.
24.0 New Construction - Outbuildings	116-117	

M. Pittman asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a COA to Mike Prickett for the construction of a 22’x30’ detached garage on a block foundation with a 6/12 pitch roof, LP siding, 2 Sun windows, 2 fiberglass doors, a steel overhead door, and the installation of LP siding on the primary structure at 921 W. First St.”

Seconded by M. Zink.

Roll Call:

- M. Zink Approved
- S. Palmer Approved
- M. Pittman Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved
- C. Rogers Approved

The motion to grant the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

Page 8
 Historic District Board of Review
 June 26, 2023

Old/New Business:

J. Wilber discussed the updated approval guidelines. K. McWilliams proposed to allow staff to review applications for non-historic chimney demolition.

Staff Report:

June 2023 Fast-Track Applications

Applicant	Address	COA
Timothy Hill	113 W. Main St.	Install signage on front windows
Brian Cole	514 E. Third St.	Replace existing replacement windows w/ fibrex wood windows of same size, shape, & configuration
Maria Napoli	322 W. Main St.	Install signage on front window
Vivian Burton/ Children’s Advocacy Center	112 East St.	Replace existing non-original wood windows w/ 6/6 aluminum clad windows to restore federal detailing

May 2022 COA Review

Applicant	Address	COA	Completion Status
Bobby Cook/ Betty Walters	130 Mulberry	Install the proposed already installed exposed fastener metal roof	Yes
Bobby Cook/ Betty Walters	130 Mulberry	Replace the decorative bargeboard	Yes
Bobby Cook/ Betty Walters	130 Mulberry	Remove the chimney	Yes
David Cheatham & Amy Eberwine	816 W. First St.	Build a 15’x12’ frame addition on a concrete slab integrating the new roof into the existing roof & using the same shingles & siding that are on the existing roof & other addition to match the rest of the home	Yes

David Cheatham & Amy Eberwine	816 W. First	Install vinyl windows that match rest of home	Yes
Randy Eggenpiller	813 W. First	Install the proposed roof covering of the rear deck	Yes
Bryan & Tara Pierce	1107 W. Main	Replace existing windows w/ vinyl; infill 2 doors on the front porch & replace 1 window on porch with a doorway opening	Yes
Brandon Taylor	1306 W. Second	Build 12'x24' addition on the rear of the house w/ 4 vinyl windows & vinyl siding to match existing materials on rest of home	Yes
Riverside Group, LLC	410 St. Michaels	Build 1012 ft ² home using LP Smartsiding, aluminum clad windows, & asphalt shingle	Yes
Deborah & Dale Anderson	417 Presbyterian	Build infill construction for either a garage w/ a residence on top or a single-story garage	In Progress
Louis Joyner Architect	403 W. First	Construct a spiral staircase	Yes
City of Madison	822 E. First	Demolish the non-historic structure	Yes
City of Madison	150 Harrison	Demolish the non-historic structure	Yes
City of Madison	400 W. Vaughn	Demolish the non-historic structure	Yes
FastSigns	701 Broadway	Install 3 signs	Yes
FastSigns	630 Broadway	Install sign	Yes
FastSigns	600 West	Install sign	Yes
Jody Bennett	102 Walnut	Replace garage door & roof w/ wood garage door & standing seam metal roof	Yes
Sandra Bailey	736 W. Third	Install wrought iron fence along side front yard, remove awnings, replace wood porch floor w/ composite deck floor, install railing at porch steps	Porch floor yes; all other projects no
Dwight Lindsay	719 W. Second	Replace existing asbestos siding w/ composite siding	Yes
J. Michael & Starla Raley	427 Mulberry	Replace existing non-original wood windows w/ 6/6 aluminum clad windows to	Yes

Page 10
Historic District Board of Review
June 26, 2023

HMI	118 W. Third	restore historic window configuration	Yes
		Install wrought iron fence along front property line	Yes

C. Rogers made a motion to adjourn the meeting – seconded by S. Palmer.

Meeting adjourned at 7:07 p.m.

BY ORDER OF THE MADISON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW



Mike Pittman, Vice-Chairman



Brooke Peach
Historic Preservationist