

HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

Minutes

November 27, 2023

The Madison City Historic District Board of Review held the regularly scheduled meeting on Monday, November 27, 2023 at 5:30 p.m. at 101 W. Main Street. Josh Wilber presided over the meeting with the following members present: Owen McCall, Carol Ann Rogers, and Sandy Palmer. Also present was Nicole M Schell – Director of Planning.

J. Wilber gave an overview of what to expect for those who have never been to a Historic District Board of Review meeting. Once the application is announced the applicant or representative will come up to the microphone to answer any questions. N. Schell will present the particulars on the project. The board will then go through a list of items to see if they meet the guidelines. J. Wilber added that at the end of each application the board will vote.

10/23/2023 Minutes:

J. Wilber asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting for October 23, 2023 and had any corrections or additions.

S. Palmer moved to approve the minutes. Seconded by O. McCall.

Roll Call:

J. Wilber	Approved
O. McCall	Approved
C. Rogers	Approved
S. Palmer	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved

Minutes stand approved.

Applications:

1. Steve Buchanan – C. of A. to build top floor addition on north side of structure.
Location: 407 E. Vaughn Dr. Zoned: Open Space (OS)

N. Schell showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. There was no representative present at the meeting. Application was deemed incomplete and has been removed from future dockets.

2. Lisa Farris – C. of A. to replace existing wood door with wood grain fiberglass door.
Location: 803 E Second St Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

N. Schell showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Lisa Farris was present.

J. Wilber asked about the deterioration of the existing door. L. Farris noted that while it is hard to see from the photos, the weathering lines go pretty deep. Glass Unlimited estimated the door would need to be sanded at least 1 inch deep. O. McCall mentioned that wood doors should be repaired with epoxy resin and could last at least another 100 years. O. McCall noted the proposed door design did not match the home's style.

L. Farris mentioned she was open to another style door however she did not want a large glass window in the door due to security concerns.

J. Wilber asked for public comment and noted none.

Page 2
 Historic District Board of Review
 November 27, 2023

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
9.0 DOORS AND ENTRANCES	59-61	<p><i>S. Palmer</i> – We’ve talked about using epoxy to strengthen deteriorated wood doors. The proposed door style is more of a craftsman type and does not match the existing door. Based on the findings of facts, I do not think the request is in conformance with the guidelines.</p> <p><i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>O. McCall</i> – I agree for the same reasons.</p> <p><i>C. Rogers</i> – I disagree. I understand the safety concern and I think that the replacement door is a better idea than repairing the existing door.</p> <p><i>J. Wilber</i> – I could get past the replacement door however the proposed design is a concern. I think the project would be better with a solid door. I also understand the safety concern that Carol Ann mentioned.</p>

N. Schell asked the applicant if she would like to amend her application prior to the vote to a solid door.
 L. Farris agreed to amend her application to a solid wood grained fiberglass door.

J. Wilber asked for a motion. C. Rogers made the following motion; “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a certificate of appropriateness to Lisa Farris at 308 E Second Street, for the proposed solid fiberglass door with a wood grain and retain the transom.

Seconded by K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

S. Palmer	Disapproved
J. Wilber	Approved
O. McCall	Disapproved
C. Rogers	Approved
K. McWilliams	Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

3. Scott Murphy – C. of A. to add front porch. Remove existing windows on the east side and replace them with smaller windows. Replace front door. Extend rear deck. Remove rear windows. Move back door 1-ft east.

Location: 1205 W Main St Zoned: Residential Medium Density (R-8)

N. Schell showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Scott Murphy and contractor Tom Matthews were present.

S. Murphy noted that during their interior demolition they uncovered the framing of an original transom and requested that be added to the application for reinstallation. S. Murphy also asked to be allowed to remove a concrete step that would have led to another doorway that has since been removed.

J. Wilber asked about the east wall windows. S. Murphy stated the existing window is not original and would like to do three smaller windows. J. Wilber asked for an explanation of the deck project.

S. Murphy stated that he would take off the existing deck and build a new deck that ran the length of the home's rear addition. The other change on the rear was removal all the windows to allow space for two bathrooms and moving the doorway to be in line with the front door.

O. McCall noted the application included a change in the roofing material. N. Schell noted she missed that portion of the application but thought it could be reviewed by staff. If it was determined that it couldn't be reviewed by staff, she would add it to the next agenda.

J. Wilber asked for clarification on the porch. S. Murphy noted that it would have wood columns and railing, a concrete floor, and be smaller gable than the existing home. J. Wilber asked about the attic vent. T. Matthews noted that they could add it to the gabled part of the porch.

J. Wilber asked about the window material. S. Murphy stated he would be using a aluminum clad wood window.

J. Wilber asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
9.0 DOORS AND ENTRANCES	59-61	<i>K. McWilliams</i> – I think this project meets the guidelines. <i>O. McCall</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree. <i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>K. McWilliams</i> stated you wouldn't be adding a new doorway but in the rear you are moving the door. I agree that it is all within the scope of the guidelines. I would like staff to make sure the east windows are appropriate size.
14.0 PORCHES	68-70	
18.0 WINDOWS	82-86	
27.0 NEW CONSTRUCTION – DECKS	109	

J. Wilber asked for a motion. S. Palmer made the following motion, "Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a certificate of appropriateness to Scott Murphy at 1205 W Main Street, to add front porch, restore the transom, remove existing windows on the east side and replace them with smaller aluminum clad wood windows, replace front doors, extend rear deck, remove rear windows and move back door 1-ft east. The applicant will work with staff on the size of the east windows."

Seconded by C. Rogers.

Roll Call:

- S. Palmer Approved
- J. Wilber Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- C. Rogers Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

Page 4
 Historic District Board of Review
 November 27, 2023

- 4. Madison Pilgrim Holliness Church – C. of A. to Build a 20-ft x 25-ft addition on the rear of the home and reattach the existing deck. The addition will have a block foundation, wood-frame construction and will match the existing home’s vinyl windows, vinyl siding, and shingle roof.
 Location: 1016 Park Ave Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

N. Schell showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Nathan Grissom was present.

N. Grissom noted the application included a change in the roof pitch on the addition. The addition will not be as steep as the existing gable roof. J. Wilber asked about the window material. N. Grissom stated he would like to use vinyl to match the existing vinyl windows.

J. Wilber asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
26.0 NEW CONSTRUCTION – ADDITIONS	106-108	<i>O. McCall</i> – While wood windows are most appropriate for new additions, this home already has vinyl windows. This project is essentially consistent with the guidelines. The deck is at the rear and has to be elevated due to the slope of the lot. This application is in conformance with the guidelines. <i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree.
27.0 NEW CONSTRUCTION – DECKS	109	<i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree for the same reasons.

J. Wilber asked for a motion. O. McCall made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a certificate of appropriateness to Madison Pilgrim Holliness Church and Nathan Grissom at 1016 Park Ave, for a new addition on the rear of the home which will have a change in slope of the roofline and for a new deck construction off the addition.”

Seconded by C. Rogers.

Roll Call:

- S. Palmer Approved
- J. Wilber Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- C. Rogers Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 5. Curt Rafferty – C. of A. to replace existing canvas awning with black metal awning. Modify storefront entryway with new doors and windows. Add architectural elements to cornice. Add 6-ft black chain link fence on west alley side to the rear and wrap around rear of the building to conceal dumpster area. Remove metal overhangs on the rear of the building.
 Location: 120 E Second St Zoned: Central Business District (CBD)

Page 5
 Historic District Board of Review
 November 27, 2023

N. Schell showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Tony Steinhardt, Director of Economic and Redevelopment for the City of Madison and Curt Rafferty, owner/developer were present.

C. Rafferty mentioned he found at 1950s cornice which he might use on the building. K. McWilliams asked about the fence project. C. Rafferty stated it would run from the building to the alley and towards the back, stopping at the edge of the ramp. The rear fence would pick up at the end of the building along the alley towards first street. Along first street would be fencing and gates. J. Wilber asked about the storefront changes. C. Rafferty stated they would be maintaining the brick columns, and the windows would be set within the existing openings. J Wilber asked about the door project. C. Rafferty stated they would be replacing them with new metal doors.

J. Wilber asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
6.0 AWNINGS AND CANOPIES	54-55	<i>S. Palmer</i> – They are replacing the awning with appropriate materials, design, and dimensions. They are adding a cornice based on historical evidence. They are using clear glass on the storefront windows. They are using black vinyl coated chain-link fence and its inobtrusive. I think they are in conformance. <i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>O. McCall</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree for the same reasons.
7.0 CORNICES	56	
17.0 STOREFRONTS	78-81	
20.0 FENCES AND WALLS	88-90	

J. Wilber asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion, "Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a certificate of appropriateness to Curt Rafferty at 120 E Second Street, to replace existing canvas awning with black metal awning, modify storefront entryway with new doors and windows, add architectural elements to cornice of either design, add 6-ft black chain link fence on west alley side to the rear and wrap around rear of the building to conceal dumpster area and to remove metal overhangs on the rear of the building."

Seconded by S. Palmer.

Roll Call:

- S. Palmer Approved
- J. Wilber Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- C. Rogers Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 6. Dee Comstock – C. of A. to Demolition of rear addition and add windows and siding. Demolish the existing front porch and add an overhang over the doorway. Replace windows.
 Location: 302 Marine St Zoned: Residential Medium Density (R-8)

N. Schell showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Joel Storm was present to represent the applicant.

J. Wilber asked for clarification on which part of the home would be demolished. J. Storm stated it would be everything under the shed roof which she believed was added in the 1970s. The intent of the owner is to restore the original 1920s home. J. Wilber asked about the porch project. J. Storm stated that the owner had provided two sample photos of porches one with a gable roof and one with a shed roof. Her porch would still have to be off-centered but that was the design styles she'd like approved.

J. Wilber asked about the window project. J. Storm noted that the windows were pretty deteriorated, and it would be necessary to replace those existing windows or repair them. The replacement windows would be wood. J. Wilber asked if the plan was to install new windows on the new exterior wall once the addition is removed. J. Storm stated that there may be a couple of new windows. J. Storm stated there would also be a new door.

J. Wilber asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
6.0 AWNINGS AND CANOPIES	54-55	<i>K. McWilliams</i> – The proposed canopies are of traditional design, one with a shed roof and the other is a gabled roof. Both are of traditional materials. The new windows will match the existing one over one windows. The new window openings will not alter the historic character of the building. The property owner is demolishing a 1970s or later addition on a 1920s home. It is not original so I think it meets the guidelines. <i>O. McCall</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree. <i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree for the same reasons.
18.0 WINDOWS	82-86	
32.0 DEMOLITION	116-117	

J. Wilber asked for a motion. S. Palmer made the following motion, "Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a certificate of appropriateness to Dee Comstock represented by Joel Storm at 302 Marine Street, to demolition of rear addition, add wood windows and siding on the new exterior wall, and demolish the existing front porch and add an overhang over the doorway based on the photos provided with the application."

Seconded by K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

- S. Palmer Approved
- J. Wilber Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- C. Rogers Approved

Page 7
 Historic District Board of Review
 November 27, 2023

K. McWilliams Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 7. Brian Marshall – C. of A. to build a 13-ft x 26-ft addition on the rear of the building to replace the unsafe addition recently demolished.
 Location: 1003 East St Zoned: Residential Medium Density (R-8)

N. Schell showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Brian Marshall was present. N. Schell noted the previous addition was demolished after being declared unsafe by the building inspector.

J. Wilber asked about the roof pitch. B. Marshall stated it would match the existing home. J. Wilber asked about the materials. B. Marshall stated he would like to amend the application to allow for a standing seam roof on both the addition and the main structure. The windows would match the existing vinyl windows. The outside would be LP Smart siding.

J. Wilber asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
26.0 NEW CONSTRUCTION – ADDITIONS	106-108	<i>O. McCall</i> – Additions should be located at the rear which this is. It is smaller so it will not overpower the main structure. The design elements are compatible. I feel that this proposal does meet the guidelines. <i>C. Rogers</i> – I agree. <i>S. Palmer</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>K. McWilliams</i> – I agree for the same reasons. <i>J. Wilber</i> – I agree for the same reasons.

J. Wilber asked for a motion. O. McCall made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a certificate of appropriateness to Brian Marshall at 1003 East Street, for the proposed new rear addition which will have LP Smart siding or equivalent, standing seam roof, and vinyl windows to be consistent with the vinyl windows that already exist in the main part of the home, and replace the existing shingle roof on the main structure with new standing seam roof.”

Seconded by K. McWilliams.

Roll Call:

- S. Palmer Approved
- J. Wilber Approved
- O. McCall Approved
- C. Rogers Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

8. Marcus Gray – C. of A. to replace existing 110" x 114" sign with new illuminated sign of similar size.

Location: 906 E First St Zoned: General Business (GB)

N. Schell showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Chris Heitz was present and represented Marcus Gray.

J. Wilber asked about the illumination of the sign. C. Heitz stated the arrow would have bulbs and the rest would be internally illuminated. S. Palmer asked if there would be motion with any of the lights. C. Heitz said they could be programmed to flash, but he and the owner had not discussed that. J. Wilber asked if the bulbs would be dim enough not to be a problem for the neighbors. C. Heitz agreed.

J. Wilber asked if the sign would be double or single sided. C. Heitz stated it would be single sided. K. McWilliams asked staff about the sign standard size. N. Schell stated the freestanding sign falls under 16 square feet. C. Heitz confirmed that the proposed sign was outside the ordinance and explained that was because of the location. S. Palmer asked about grandfather clauses in the ordinance. N. Schell explained that there were no grandfather clauses for signs.

There was further discussion on the internal illumination of the sign. C. Heitz stated he would likely use channel letters with illumination. O. McCall stated the guidelines do not allow for internal illumination.

J. Wilber asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
16.0 SIGNS	74-77	<p><i>S. Palmer</i> – Signs should not visually overwhelm the building or streetscape which this is in conformance with. It’s a big sign but way off the road. Internally illuminated or flashing signs are not appropriate, and this sign is not in conformance with 16.6. Signs cannot exceed 16 sq ft and 25 ft in height. I would say that it is not in conformance with the guidelines.</p> <p><i>K. McWilliams</i> – S. Palmer stated it doesn’t match the guidelines which is probably true however the location may be unique enough.</p> <p><i>O. McCall</i> – The sign is way too big but since it is replacing a sign that is even bigger and sits off the street, it needs to be bigger than the guidelines allow. I think we can allow this technical violation of the guidelines. However, the proposal for backlighting is a violation.</p> <p><i>C. Rogers</i> – I love the proposed sign. For the visibility I think it needs to be larger. I would agree with the sign if the applicant would compromise on the lighting.</p> <p><i>J. Wilber</i> – There’s always the rarity that comes to play for historic guidelines and the city ordinance where you can’t think of everything that might happen. We have other billboards downtown. This is a unique application and I think the sign with externally light channel type lighting is fine.</p>

J. Wilber asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion, “Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a certificate of appropriateness to Marcus Gray at 906 E First Street, to replace existing 110" x 114" sign with new illuminated sign of similar size.”

Seconded by C. Rogers.

Roll Call:

- S. Palmer Disapproved
- J. Wilber Approved
- O. McCall Disapproved
- C. Rogers Approved
- K. McWilliams Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

- 9. Scott Rinear on behalf of Barb McPherson – C. of A. to install ribbed metal roof with wood structure over existing rear deck.

Location: 901 W First St Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

This application was deemed incomplete due to the notification signs not being posted as required. It was moved to the next agenda.

Old/New Business:

No old or new business.

Staff Report:

November 2023 Fast-Track Applications

Applicant	Address	COA
Riley, Elizabeth	605 W Main St.	lighting
Murphy, Scott	1205 W. Main St.	siding; lights
Rutherford, Kathryn	423 W Main St.	windows
Le Saux, Catherine	414 Elm St.	porch steps; handrail
Cheryl Huy	511 Mulberry St.	wood composite fence
Riley, Elizabeth	605 W Main St.	16" x 34' 10.5" flat sign
Gray, Marcus	928 Park Ave.	60" x 36" freestanding sign
Heitz Sign Company	114 E Main St.	20" x 96" x 1/4" flat sign
Guetig, Brian	805 E Second St	Windows
Johnson, Bumper	125 Jefferson St	LP Smart Siding

Page 10
 Historic District Board of Review
 November 27, 2023

November 2022 COA Review

Applicant	Address	COA	Completion Status
City of Madison	400 W. Vaughn Dr.	pool	In Progress
Jaroq	223 W. First St.	siding, window – Denied	NA
Hagemeir, Tami	701 W. First St.	storage buildings – Denied	NA

O. McCall made a motion to adjourn the meeting – seconded by S. Pamler.

Meeting adjourned at 7:42 p.m.

BY ORDER OF THE MADISON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW



Josh Wilber, Chairman



Nicole M Schell
 Director of Planning