HISTORIC DISTRICT BOAD OF REVIEW

Minutes January 22, 2024

The Madison City Historic District Board of Review held the regularly scheduled meeting on Monday, January 22, 2024 at 5:30 p.m. at 101 W. Main Street. Mike Pittman presided over the meeting with the following members present: Happy Smith, Micheal Zink, Ken McWilliams, and Sandy Palmer. Also present were Nicole M Schell – Director of Planning and Devon Sharpe - Attorney.

M. Pittman gave an overview of what to expect for those who have never been to a Historic District Board of Review meeting. Once the application is announced the applicant or representative will come up to the microphone to answer any questions. N. Schell will present the particulars on the project. The board will then go through a list of items to see if they meet the guidelines. M. Pittman added that at the end of each application the board will vote.

12/18/2023 Minutes:

M. Pittman asked if everyone had a chance to read the minutes for the meeting for December 18, 2023 and had any corrections or additions.

K. McWilliams moved to approve the minutes. Seconded by S. Palmer.

Roll Call:

M. Pittman

Approved

H. Smith

Approved

M. Zink

Approved

S. Palmer

Approved

K. McWilliams

Approved

Minutes stand approved.

Election of HDBR Officers

M. Pittman opened the floor for nominations for 2024 chair. K. McWilliams nominated M. Pittman as chair. Seconded by S. Palmer. No other nominations were submitted.

Roll Call:

S. Palmer

Approved

M. Pittman

Approved

H. Smith

Approved

M. Zink

Approved

K. McWilliams

Approved

M. Pittman was elected 2024 HDBR chair.

M. Pittman opened the floor for nominations for 2024 vice-chair. H. Smith nominated S. Palmer as vice-chair. Seconded by K. McWilliams. No other nominations were submitted.

Roll Call:

S. Palmer

Approved

Page 2 Historic District Board of Review January 22, 2024

M. Pittman

Approved

H. Smith

Approved

M. Zink

Approved

K. McWilliams

Approved

S. Palmer was elected 2024 HDBR vice-chair.

Applications:

1. Sankalp Pampattiwar – C. of A. to remove a side door and replace with a window. Location: 513 West St

Zoned: Central Business District (CBD)

This application was deemed incomplete due to lack of representation at the meeting as required, it was moved to the next agenda.

 Judy Staicer and Robert Schwartz – C. of A. to replace 4 awning-over-awning wood windows on the north and south sides with one-over-one aluminum-clad sash windows.
 Location: 518 E Second St Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

N. Schell showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Judy Staicer and Robert Schwartz were present.

- J. Staicer noted that the windows being replaced were located in the 1956 rear addition. J. Staicer stated because of the size of the openings, they could not find solid wood windows to fit.
- S. Palmer asked for clarification on the replacement windows. J. Staicer stated they would be one-overone sash windows made of aluminum clad. M. Pittman asked about the condition of the current windows. R. Schwartz stated they do not seal and are leaking onto the floor. J. Staicer stated the windows also cannot be closed completed and believed they are the original windows when the addition was built.
- M. Pittman asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline Page #	Discussion
18.0 WINDOWS	82-86	S. Palmer – Retain and preserve historic windows, including all significant related elements, when you can. I question whether these are historic windows and believe they are not. Replacing inkind using replacement windows that match the existing elements or as closely as possible. I'd say that you're in conformance. Replacements must match the originals in overall size, and you are doing that. New window openings shall not alter the historic character of the building. And again, this is the new addition. I think you are in conformance. I think the request is in conformance to our guidelines. M. Zink – I agree for the same reasons. H. Smith – I agree for the same reasons. K. McWilliams – I agree for the same reasons. M. Pittman – I agree for the same reasons.

Page 3 Historic District Board of Review January 22, 2024

M. Pittman asked for a motion. S. Palmer made the following motion, "Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a certificate of Appropriateness to Judy Stacy and Robert Schwartz for the replacement windows on the north and south side of the 1956 addition to the house at 518 East second Street."

Seconded by M. Zink.

Roll Call:

S. Palmer

Approved

M. Pittman

Approved

H. Smith

Approved

M. Zink

Approved

K. McWilliams

Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

3. Shina Murdock – C. of A. to build a carport at the rear of the property.

Location: 120 Jefferson St Zoned: Central Business District (CBD)

N. Schell showed photos provided by the applicant and explained the changes proposed by the applicant. Mike Prickett was present and represented the application.

S. Palmer noted that there was a little shed or carport at the rear. M. Prickett stated that was still planning to be removed. M. Prickett noted that the design changed because of her appearance during another city board meeting. M. Pittman asked about the size of the structure. M. Prickett stated it would be about 12-ft tall. S. Palmer asked about the roof material. M. Prickett stated it would be ribbed metal. M. Pittman asked about the other board's approval. M. Prickett stated the setbacks were approved with the new design.

M. Pittman asked for public comment and noted none.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings of Fact Worksheet

Building Element	Guideline	Discussion
24.0 NEW CONSTRUCTION- OUTBUILDINGS	Page # 101-102	M. Zink – The design of the new garage and other accessory building should be compatible with the dwellings in the historic district, and I believe that it is. The site of the new garages and accessory buildings should be appropriate on the lot. It meets all of its setback requirements and is located behind the home. The outbuilding should maintain a proportional mass, size, and height to ensure that it is not taller or wider than the principal building on the lot, which it is not. The materials used for the new garage and outbuilding should reflect the historical development of the property and it appears that it does. Generally, the eaves and the roof edges of any new buildings, any new outbuildings, should not be higher than those of the existing primary building, and it does not. New carport should be located in the rear of the dwelling and not visible and it is not. So based on the information that we have from findings of fact it does meet its guidelines. S. Palmer – I agree for the same reasons. K. McWilliams – I agree for the same reasons. H. Smith – I agree for the same reasons. M. Pittman – I agree for the same reasons.

Page 4 Historic District Board of Review January 22, 2024

M. Pittman asked for a motion. K. McWilliams made the following motion, "So based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Madison Historic District Board of Review grant a certificate of appropriateness to Shina Murdock at 120 Jefferson Street to build a carport on the rear of the property with exposed fastener roof metal roof."

Seconded by M. Zink.

Roll Call:

S. Palmer

Approved

M. Pittman

Approved

H. Smith

Approved

M. Zink

Approved

K. McWilliams

Approved

The motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness was approved. A Certificate will be issued for the entire project.

4. Russell Benkert – C. of A. to remove current windows and replace with more environmentally friendly aluminum clad windows. Remove siding wrap house with house wrap and replace siding with LP smart siding. Remove windows in bedrooms on second level that are 12" from floor level to make them safe for children. Remove fireplace and chimney in rear section of house and leave the chimney in the front section of house. Open up rear covered porch and make it open. Possibly add dormer to roof similar to the adjoining duplex. Remove door on north side of house.

Location: 423 Mill St

Zoned: Historic District Residential (HDR)

This application was deemed incomplete due to lack of representation at the meeting as required. It was moved to the next agenda.

Terry Souter, representing Mary Lou Munier, who lives at 421 Mill Street asked to speak on the application. T. Souter mentioned a concern with the way the front siding would come together and was worried about that with a different product on half it would take away from the integrity of the building.

H. Smith asked when the dormer was installed on the 421 Mill St portion. T. Souter stated it was already there before M. Munier purchased the property and she's lived there for 40 years.

Old/New Business:

- M. Pittman mentioned the need to track training hours and asked the board members to send any trainings they've completed to N. Schell.
- S. Palmer asked how many times an incomplete application could be extended. D. Sharpe stated there was no limit, but the board could always deny the application.

Staff Report:

January 2024 Fast-Track Applications

Applicant	Address	COA
Martin, Jane	907 W Main St	windows
Schwartz, Robert	518 E Second St	storm windows
Ralston, Landon	409 E Second St	windows
Jewell, William	601 Walnut St	Fence
Hayes, Helenna	704 W Main St	Sign

Page 5 Historic District Board of Review January 22, 2024

January 2023 COA Review

Applicant	Address	COA	Completion Status
Lynn, Chris and Gina	214 W. Second St.	doors/windows	Completed
Grote, Rick	1029 W. Second St.	solar panels	

M. Zink made a motion to adjourn the meeting – seconded by S. Palmer.

Meeting adjourned at 5:56 p.m.

BY ORDER OF THE MADISON CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

Mike Pittman, Chairman

Nicole M Schell, Director of Planning

